NOTES

Introduction

5 For a discussion of “weak” democracy, see Barrow and Bullock, Democratic Ideas and the British Labour Movement, especially 292–94.
6 On Shaw, see A.M. Mcbriar, Fabian Socialism and English Politics, 1884–1916, 85; and Barrow and Bullock, Democratic Ideas and the British Labour Movement, 176.
7 See Kevin Morgan, “English Guild Socialists and the Exemplar of the Panama Canal.”
9 Chushichi Tsuzuki, H.M. Hyndman and British Socialism, 268.
11 Tony Judt, Ill Fares the Land: A Treatise on Our Present Discontents, 142.
12 More precisely, it was the Social-Democratic Party (SDP) writ large. The SDF had changed its name from “Federation” to “Party” in 1907, a few years before the formation of the BSP.
13 For changes in Pankhurst’s organizations, see Ian Bullock, “Sylvia Pankhurst and the Russian Revolution.”
16 Ralph Darlington, The Political Trajectory of J.T. Murphy, 261.


21 Gidon Cohen, The Failure of a Dream: The Independent Labour Party from Disaffiliation to World War II.


CHAPTER 1
Well-Prepared Ground: The British Left on the Eve of the Russian Revolution


4 Ibid., Appendix 1, 303.

5 Kendall attributes the term “impossibilist” to Theodore Rothstein, who will figure prominently later in this book (especially in chapter 5). A year after the formation of the SLP, another “impossibilist” organization, the Socialist Party of Great Britain, was formed by SDF dissidents. It began with about a hundred members. (See Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, chap. 1.) The SPGB never viewed itself, nor was it viewed, as a possible constituent of a British communist party and so falls beyond the scope of the “far left” considered in this book. But it survived, and indeed still exists today.

6 Ibid., Appendix 5, 314.

7 New Statesman, 18 September 1920.

8 The Herald, 27 January 1917.

9 The Herald, 28 July 1917.


12 Justice, 25 October 1884.
13 Justice, 5 August 1893.
14 On the Clarion federation, see A.M. Thompson, Hail Referendum! The Shortest Way to Democracy, Clarion pamphlet no. 7 (1895); The Referendum and Initiative in Practice, Clarion pamphlet no. 31 (1899); and The Only Way to Democracy, Clarion pamphlet no. 35 (1900).
15 See Logie Barrow and Ian Bullock, Democratic Ideas and the British Labour Movement, 1880–1914, chap. 6.
16 The Call, 21 September 1916.
17 Justice, 9 January (Robertson) and 13 February 1919 (Hyndman).
18 Woman’s Dreadnought, 3 February 1917.
20 Woman’s Dreadnought, 2 June 1917.
21 Woman’s Dreadnought, 16 June and 21 July 1917.
22 Woman’s Dreadnought, 21 July 1917.
23 The Herald, 25 August 1917.
24 Woman’s Dreadnought, 15 September 1917.
25 Workers’ Dreadnought, 17 November 1917.
26 Workers’ Dreadnought, 19 January and 26 January 1918.
27 Workers’ Dreadnought, 20 April (Watson) and 9 March 1918 (Pankhurst).
28 Workers’ Dreadnought, 4 May 1918.
29 The Call, 2 May 1918. Pankhurst’s argument was similar to the position that Alex Thompson eventually arrived at in the late 1890s, in his series of pamphlets on the referendum and initiative. See Barrow and Bullock, Democratic Ideas and the British Labour Movement, 50–56.
30 Workers’ Dreadnought, 27 April 1918.
31 Labour Leader, 1 January 1920.
32 The Call, 8 January 1920.
33 James Hinton, The First Shop-Stewards’ Movement, 298; Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, 278.
34 The Guildsman, January 1917.
36 Solidarity, October 1917.
37 Justice, 13 December 1917.
38 Murphy, The Workers’ Committee, 19.
39 Ibid., 20–21.
40 Ibid., 21–23. Trades councils were composed of union branches, rather than being based on individual workplaces.
41 Ibid., 26.
42 Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, 153.
43 Labour Leader, 18 January 1917.
44 Wartime restrictions on the availability of newsprint meant that The Herald had
been unable to continue as a daily and was now published weekly. The first part
of Hobson’s series appeared on 17 February 1917, and the series continued on a
weekly basis, with the odd interruption caused in part by the need to give space to
the events in Russia.

45 The Herald, 11 August 1917. The “never-ending audacity of elected persons” was
a quotation from Walt Whitman popularized in British socialist circles by Robert
Blatchford many years before.

46 Labour Leader, 22 March 1917.

47 Labour Leader, 16 October 1919.

48 Daily Herald, 18 August 1920.


50 Lisanne Radice, Beatrice and Sydney Webb: Fabian Socialists, 223.

51 Workers’ Dreadnought, 17 May 1924.

52 See Kendall’s The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, chap. 1, for the “split,” and
chap. 4, for the evolution of the SLP.


54 Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, 69.

55 Ibid., 67, quoting Daniel De Leon, Socialist Reconstruction of Society, 3–4, published
in Glasgow, probably in 1905.

56 The Socialist, April 1908, quoted in Raymond Challinor, The Origins of British Bolshevisms, 52–53.

57 Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, 133. Kendall quotes from Tom Bell’s
Pioneering Days, 149–51.

58 On delegation and the survival of trends towards “direct democracy” in trade unions
in a wider context, see Anthony Carew, Democracy and Government in European

59 For NIGFTLU, see Barrow and Bullock, Democratic Ideas and the British Labour
Movement, 88–135 (chaps. 5 and 6); for the views of the influential socialist journal-
ist Robert Blatchford on leaders, see 45–50; on anti-leadership attitudes in the
trade unions, see 89–92.

60 The Clarion, 25 June 1898.

61 J.T. Murphy, The Workers’ Committee, 14.

CHAPTER 2
Initial Responses to the Russian Revolution: The British Left in 1917 and the
Leeds “Soviet” Convention

1 The Herald, 24 March 1917 (Lansbury); Woman’s Dreadnought, 31 March 1917
(Pankhurst).

2 See Keith Laybourn, Philip Snowden: A Biography, 1864–1937, 76. Laybourn
corrects Snowden’s own account, in his autobiography, which has his wife start-
ing the Women’s Peace Crusade much later, in November rather than August or

3 Justice, 22 March and 5 April 1917.
4 Labour Leader, 29 March and 5 April 1917.
5 The Herald, 7 April and 12 May 1917.
6 Maurice B. Reckitt, As It Happened: An Autobiography, 152; Raymond Postgate, The Life of George Lansbury, 165.
7 Original poster for the event, in the author’s possession.
9 Labour Leader, 26 April 1917. Chernov would briefly chair the ill-fated Constituent Assembly. No one on the British Left at that time would have given the least credence to Richard Pipes’s dismissal of the Petrograd Soviet as “a private body, irregularly constituted and directed by representatives of socialist parties who no one had elected” (The Russian Revolution, 1899–1919, 297).
10 Labour Leader, 5 April 1917.
11 Labour Leader, 12 April 1917.
12 Woman’s Dreadnought, 24 March 1917.
13 The Herald, 12 May 1917.
16 The Herald, 19 May 1917; The Call, 24 May 1917.
17 The Herald, 19 May 1917.
18 The Call, 31 May 1917. Lansbury corrected the spelling in his autobiography when he referred to the “Magna Carta,” whose demands he thought had stood the test of time (My Life, 188).
19 Labour Leader, 17 May 1917.
20 Labour Leader, 24 May 1917.
21 The Herald, 9 June 1917. For Fairchild’s background, see Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, 227, n. 36.
22 Labour Leader, 31 May 1917.
23 The Herald, 26 May 1917.
24 Woman’s Dreadnought, 2 June 1917.
25 Justice, 2 June 1917.
26 The Herald, 24 March 1917.

Dora Montefiore (1851–1933) is chiefly remembered as a campaigner for women’s suffrage and women’s rights more generally, both in Britain and Australia. For Montefiore, see, especially, the work of Karen Hunt, such as “Gendering the
Politics of the Working Woman’s Home,” in Women and the Making of Built Space in England, 1870–1950, ed. Elizabeth Darling and Lesley Whitworth (Aldershot, Hampshire, UK: Ashgate, 2007), 107–22. Constance Malleson (1895–1975) was an actress whose stage name was Colette O’Niel, as well as the author of two novels and other books. Married to the actor Miles Malleson until their divorce in 1923, she was a pacifist during World War I and Bertrand Russell’s lover. Nearly half a century later, Russell briefly recalled attending at Leeds “a great meeting of sympathisers” with what he called the “Kerensky Revolution.” The meeting, he said, was also attended by “Colette and her husband” (The Autobiography of Bertrand Russell, vol. 2, 1914–1944, 31).

See the reports in The Call, 7 June 1917, and in The Herald, 9 June 1917.

Justice, 7 June 1917.


Ibid., 451 and 450.

Ibid., 453.

Labour Leader, 7 June 1917; The Call, 7 June 1917.

The Herald, 9 June 1917.

The Herald, 2 June 1917.

Woman’s Dreadnought, 9 June 1917. The WSF had put forward a very large number of amendments, including the ones quoted in the previous chapter. Given the limited time available at the conference, it is impossible to see how they could all have been debated, even if no other participants had followed suit with amendments of their own.

The Call, 7 June 1917.

Labour Leader, 7 June 1917.

The Call, 7 June 1917.

The Herald, 9 June 1917.

The Call, 7 June 1917.

J.T. Walton Newbold did use the phrase in an article that appeared in the 12 July 1917 issue of The Call, but this was, of course, after Williams had begun to popularize the expression in left-wing circles.

See The Communist, 30 April 1921. This particular “Black Friday”—15 April 1921—was so called because of the perceived betrayal of the miners by their “Triple Alliance” trade union partners, the National Union of Railwaymen and the National Transport Workers’ Federation. The mines (like the railways) had been state controlled during the war, and this remained the case until the end of March 1921, when the mine owners, now back in charge, imposed wage reductions. When the miners refused to accept these, they were locked out, and their rail and transport allies were widely expected to strike in solidarity. But the NUR and NTWF decided against this, provoking much criticism and resentment, much of it directed at the secretaries of the two organizations, J.H. Thomas and Robert Williams. The “Triple Alliance” union, formed in 1910, took its name from the international diplomatic alliance between Germany, Austria-Hungary, and Italy.

Labour Leader, 7 June 1917.
45 The Herald, 2 June 1917.

46 Woman’s Dreadnought, 9 June 1917. For the proposed change of terminology from “Workmen” to “Workers,” see, for instance, *What Happened at Leeds*, in Coates, ed., *British Labour and the Russian Revolution*, 17, 18, 29. The Call was inconsistent in its nomenclature. For example, on 20 June 1918, an article titled “The International” refers to “Workmen’s,” while on 11 July, in “Litvinoff Answers Kerensky,” the term used is “Workers’,” and then, in a piece by Lenin the following week, it is “Workmen’s” again.


51 The Herald, 9 June 1917.

52 Labour Leader, 7 June 1917.

53 Justice, 7 June 1917.

54 Justice, 14 June 1917.

55 Kendall, *The Revolutionary Movement in Britain*, 129.

56 The Call, 14 June 1917.

57 The Call, 21 June 1917.

58 The Herald, 23 June 1917.

59 The Call, 28 June 1917.

60 Labour Leader, 7 June 1917.

61 The Herald, 14 July 1917.

62 The Call, 19 July 1917.

63 The Call, 7 August 1917. The Black Hundreds were extreme right-wing, anti-revolutionary, and anti-semitic organizations, which in some ways anticipated fascism, that were set up in early twentieth-century Russia, especially during and after the failed revolution of 1905.

64 The Herald, 4 August 1917.

65 The Call, 16 August 1917.

66 The Call, 23 August 1917.


68 The Herald, 8 September 1917.

69 The Guildsman, September 1917.

70 The Call, 4 October 1917. According to Hinton (*The First Shop-Stewards’ Movement*, 240), who cites Ministry of Munitions records, there were attempts to set up local committees in “at least eight areas”: London, Tyneside, Glasgow, Sheffield,
Norwich, Leicester, Bristol, and Swansea. There is no mention of the efforts to hold meetings for Manchester or the Southern Counties.

71 The Call, 25 October 1917. See also The Herald, 27 October 1917. Inkin's report now listed delegates for twelve districts, who included two women: Mrs. C.A. Findlay, representing Lancashire, Cheshire, and North Wales, and Pankhurst.

72 J.T. Murphy, Preparing for Power, 97, 141, 146.

73 Labour Leader, 7 June 1917.

74 The Call, 28 December 1917.

75 The Herald, 26 January 1918.

76 Workers’ Dreadnought, 9 February 1918. For Pankhurst’s later reflections on the national Workers’ and Soldiers’ Council, which seems to have met only four times, see Ian Bullock, “Sylvia Pankhurst and the Russian Revolution,” 130–31.

77 It is difficult to agree with Raymond Postgate that “soviet was a word only slowly assimilated” (The Life of George Lansbury, 165).

78 See Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, 157–64.

79 The Herald, 25 August 1917.

CHAPTER 3
The Bolsheviks and the British Left: The October Revolution and the Suppression of the Constituent Assembly

1 Workers’ Dreadnought, 19 July and 6 September 1919.

2 The Call, 17 July 1919. Rothstein wrote as John Bryan.


4 The Call, 27 July 1916 (Luxemburg), and 23 March, 29 June, 3 August, and 16 November 1916 (Liebknecht).

5 The Call, 13 December 1916.

6 The Call, 12 April 1917. There had been a letter from George Tchitcherine, as he then spelled his name, on 13 July 1916. Chicherin was at this time a member of the Kentish Town Branch of the BSP. See Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement, 82.

7 The Herald, 24 March 1917.

8 The Call, 30 November 1916 and 1 March 1917.

9 Justice, 26 April 1917.


11 Woman’s Dreadnought, 23 June 1917; Labour Leader, 14 June 1917.

12 Woman’s Dreadnought, 30 June 1917.

13 The Herald, 28 July 1917.

14 The Call, 7 August 1917.

15 The Herald, 1 September 1917.

16 The Herald, 8 September 1917.

17 Justice, 13 September 1917.

18 The Call, 4 October, 27 September, and 18 October 1917.
The Call, 1 November 1917. The “October Revolution” began on 25 October in the Julian calendar, which was still in use in Russia, but on 7 November in the Gregorian calendar.

Justice, 8 November 1917.

The Call, 15 November 1917.

The Call, 29 November and 6 December 1917.

The Call, 20 December 1917 and 10 January 1918 (Fairchild).


The Socialist, December 1917.

The Herald, 17 November 1917.

Labour Leader, 22 November 1917.

The Herald, 24 November 1917.

The Herald, 1 December 1917. F. M. Leventhal notes the way Lansbury distanced himself from Brailsford as regards Russian developments (The Last Dissenter: H.N. Brailsford and His World, 142).

The Herald, 29 December 1917.

Labour Leader, 6 December 1917.

The Herald, 29 December 1917. By “Revolutionary Socialists,” Brailsford is referring to the Social Revolutionary Party.

New Statesman, 8 December 1917, “The Bolshevik Revolution — Smolny Nights.” (The full text is available on the New Statesman website.) Much earlier, in its issue of 30 June, The Herald had questioned the “exquisitely ludicrous situation” whereby “the representation of British Socialism in Russia seems to have devolved entirely upon Mr Julius West.” He was, the paper said, delegated by the Fabian Society, “a small though influential body which probably does not contain five hundred manual workers in all,” and might at most represent about two thousand people. West, the twenty-six-year-old son of a Russian émigré and a member of the Fabian Society executive, had, according to the same source, been invited to Russia by the “Council of Soldiers and Workers’ Councils.” He died the following year of pneumonia, and his History of the Chartist Movement was published posthumously in 1920.

The Call, 29 March 1917.

The Call, 22 March 1917.

Woman’s Dreadnought, 23 and 30 June 1917.

Workers’ Dreadnought, 29 September 1917.

Workers’ Dreadnought, 17 November 1917.

The Call, 6 December and 13 December 1917.

Workers’ Dreadnought, 15 December 1917.


The Herald, 12 January 1918.

Justice, 17 January 1918.

Labour Leader, 24 January 1918.
46 The Herald, 9 February 1918.
47 The Herald, 23 February and 2 March 1918.
48 The Herald, 9 March 1918.
49 The Herald, 9 February 1918.
50 The Herald, 2 March 1918.
51 Workers’ Dreadnought, 26 January 1918.
52 The Call, 31 January 1918.
53 Justice, 24 January 1918.
55 Ibid., 59.
56 New Statesman, 26 January 1918.
57 Justice, 31 January 1918.
58 Labour Leader, 24 January 1918. J.T. Murphy, a leading shop steward in 1918, recalled some sixteen years later “the tremendous reception given to Litvinoff” (Preparing for Power: A Critical Study of the History of the British Working-Class Movement, 154).
59 The Herald, 26 January 1918.
60 Workers’ Dreadnought, 6 July 1918.
61 The Herald, 6 July 1918.
62 Labour Leader, 2 and 9 January 1919. For earlier Snowden comments sympathetic to the Bolsheviks, see, for example, Labour Leader, 23 May 1918.
63 Labour Leader, 6 March 1919.
65 Labour Leader, 31 January 1918.
66 Justice, 22 August 1918.
67 Justice, 5 September 1918.
69 Workers’ Dreadnought, 8 June 1918.
70 Workers’ Dreadnought, 30 November 1918. The Spartacist League (Spartakusbund) had been founded by left-wing German socialists, notably Rosa Luxemberg and Karl Liebknecht, in opposition to the SPD majority, which supported the war. It became the German Communist Party in December 1918.
71 “Free Russia Greets the German Workers,” Workers’ Dreadnought, 14 December 1918.
72 The Socialist, 30 January 1919.
73 Workers’ Dreadnought, 12 April 1919.
74 The Call, 18 July 1918.
75 Workers’ Dreadnought, 20 December 1919.
76 Quoted in The Communist, 5 November 1921.
77 The Call, 4 July 1918.
78 Workers’ Dreadnought, 21 June 1921.
CHAPTER 4
The Myth Established: The Positive View of Soviet Democracy

2 The Call, 14 February (“Learn to Speak Russian”) and 1 August 1918.
3 The Call, 13 November 1919. Willis here refers to reactionary elements as “the Black International.”
4 For contrasting views on the issue of delegation versus representation in the British socialist movement prior to World War I, see Logie Barrow and Ian Bullock, Democratic Ideas Ideas and the British Labour Movement, 1880–1914, especially chap. 2.
5 Workers’ Dreadnought, 28 December 1918.
6 The Call, 1 July 1920.
7 The Call, 21 February 1918.
8 The Call, 18 March 1920.
9 The Call, 27 May 1920.
10 Workers’ Dreadnought, 26 January 1918.
11 Workers’ Dreadnought, 10 May 1919.
12 Workers’ Dreadnought, 28 December 1918.
13 Workers’ Dreadnought, 5 April 1919.
14 The Socialist, 29 April 1920. The translator was “Miss N Capoldi.”
15 The Communist, 19 August 1920.
16 See The Call, 29 August 1918, and Labour Leader, 22 January 1920, for two examples.
17 Labour Leader, 30 May 1918.
18 The Call, 29 August 1918.
19 New Statesman, 6 March 1920.
20 The Call, 25 July 1918.
21 Solidarity, August 1918 and September 1918.
22 The Herald, 3 August 1918.
23 The Call, 6 November 1919.
24 Workers’ Dreadnought, 29 January 1921.
25 Workers’ Dreadnought, 28 December 1918.
26 New Statesman, 4 May 1918.
27 The Call, 13 November 1919.
28 Charles Read, From Tsar to Soviets: The Russian People and Their Revolution, 1917–21, 64.
30 See Diane Koenker, Moscow Workers and the 1917 Revolution, 144–86.
31 The Call, 18 July and 28 November 1918.
32 Solidarity, August 1918.
33 Workers’ Dreadnought, 24 August 1918.
34 Justice, 13 June 1918.
35 See, for example, Justice, 19 September 1918.
36 Workers’ Dreadnought, 30 April 1921.

NOTES TO PAGES 99–110
38 New Statesman, 12 July 1919.
39 “How a City Soviet Is Elected,” Workers’ Dreadnought, 11 October 1919, which cites the 7, 10, 11, 12, 13, and 29 April 1918 issues of Pravda.
40 See Orlando Figes, A People’s Tragedy: The Russian Revolution, 1891–1924, 626.
41 Ibid.
42 Workers’ Dreadnought, 12 June 1920.
43 The Socialist, 29 July 1920.
44 The Communist, 19 November 1921.
45 The Socialist, 15 January 1920.
46 Workers’ Dreadnought, 21 December 1918.
47 Labour Leader, 16 May 1918.
48 Labour Leader, 30 May 1918.
49 Labour Leader, 29 May 1919. For other instances of the paper perceiving Russian events as “an experiment,” see, for example, Labour Leader, 30 April and 1 May 1919; 29 January, 12 February, 24 June, and 16 and 28 September 1920; and 31 March 1921. For the continued use in British Labour circles of the notion that the USSR was an “experiment,” see Andrew Williams, Labour and Russia: The Attitude of the Labour Party to the USSR, 1924–34. There was at least one book published during the interwar years that used this idea as a title — Arthur Feiler and H.J. Stenning’s The Russian Experiment (1930).
50 New Statesman, 21 and 28 December 1918.
51 New Statesman, 4 January 1919.
52 New Statesman, 11 January 1919.
53 New Statesman, 26 July 1919.
54 New Statesman, 24 January 1920. The notion that the Communist system was “democratic in essence if not in form” does seem to anticipate C.B. Macpherson’s formulation decades later — quoted in the introduction — that it was democratic in “the broader sense.”
56 New Statesman, 13 March 1920.
57 The Guildsman, June 1920.
58 New Statesman, 3 April 1920.
59 New Statesman, 6 March 1920.
60 New Statesman, 5 March 1921.
61 New Statesman, 23 July 1921.
62 New Statesman, 5 November 1921. On famine relief, see the 13 August issue.
63 New Statesman, 26 June 1920. See also the 11 December 1920 issue.

CHAPTER 5
Polarized Social-Democrats: Denunciation and Debate

2 Justice, 20 June 1918.
3 Justice, 6 June and 8 August 1918.
4 Justice, 21 November 1918.
5 Justice, 15 August 1918. Shammes's first name appears in some sources as “Lewis” or “Leo.”
6 Justice, 27 June 1918.
7 Justice, 22 August 1918.
8 Justice, 7 November 1918.
9 Justice, 12 December 1918; The Call, 14 November 1918.
10 Justice, 2 January 1919.
11 Justice, 20 March 1919.
12 L.E. (Lorenzo or “Len”) Edward Quelch (1862–1937) was the brother of the prominent socialist and long-time editor of Justice, Harry Quelch. The fact that Tom Quelch, of the pro-Bolshevik BSP, was Harry’s son and Len’s nephew serves to illustrate that the wartime split in the BSP had a strong generational aspect. See Walter Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, 1900–21: The Origins of British Communism, chap. 1, n. 4, and chap. 6, nn. 82 and 114. The latest volume of the Dictionary of Labour Biography has a very comprehensive account of the life of Len Quelch, written by John S. Partington. See the Dictionary of Labour Biography, vol. 13, ed. Keith Gildart and David Howell (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 319–34.
13 Justice, 14 March 1918.
14 Justice, 19 September 1918.
15 Justice, 10 October 1918.
16 Justice, 17 October 1918.
17 Justice, 26 September 1918.
18 Justice, 14 November 1918.
19 Justice, 10 and 17 April 1919.
20 Justice, 19 June 1919.
21 Justice, 29 November 1918.
22 Justice, 2 and 9 January 1919.
23 See Logie Barrow and Ian Bullock, Democratic Ideas and the British Labour Movement, 1880–1914, 19, 42.
24 Justice, 13 February 1919.
25 Justice, 10 October 1918.
26 Justice, 7 November 1918.
27 Justice, 2 January 1919.
28 Justice, 12 June 1919. “T.D.H.”—the author of the letter, mentioned in chapter 2, arguing that the “soviet” resolution at the Leeds convention wasn’t “seriously intended”—was a fairly regular contributor to Justice.
29 Justice, 12 June 1919.
30 For biographical details, see Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, including 323, n. 66. See also David Burke, “Theodore Rothstein: Russian Emigré and British Socialist,” in From the Other Shore: Russian Political Emigrants in Britain, 1880–1917, ed. John Slatter (London: Cass, 1984), 81–99.
CHAPTER 6
Equivocal Reformists: The Independent Labour Party, the Guild Socialists, and the Reaction to Kautsky

1 Labour Leader, 7 March 1918.
2 See A. Fenner Brockway, Bermondsey Story: The Life of Alfred Salter, 72–73. As Brockway’s title suggests, Salter’s chosen field of political activity was very much a local one, though this eventually included representing West Bermondsey as its MP. His outlook was anything but parochial, however. When he visited the USSR in 1931 with a group of medical experts to investigate Soviet health provision, he found things to admire. But the view he had first expressed in 1919 remained. According to Brockway, as a “democratically-minded man,” Salter was appalled by the “absolute and ruthless suppression of all views contrary to those held by the Government clique” and by the way “dissentients,” even among “prominent Communist leaders,” simply “disappeared.” Brockway concluded that Salter was “one of the first visitors to draw attention so clearly to what are now recognised as the fundamental characteristics of the regime — the consecration of industrial advance and the conservation of political dictatorship” (161).

3 Labour Leader, 4 July 1918.
4 Labour Leader, 15 August 1918.
5 Labour Leader, 8 August 1918.
6 Labour Leader, 17 July 1919.
7 Labour Leader, 11 September 1919.
8 Justice, 25 May and 10 July 1919. In the May issue, Hyndman repeated what he had originally revealed in January of that year. He had, very typically, conducted a “long correspondence” with the British government at the beginning of 1918,
in which he had urged that Russian forces in Britain, “acting in harmony with Russian democrats,” should be sent to defend or restore the Constituent Assembly. A year later, he found it ironic that “His Majesty’s Government declares in January that it is pledged not to intervene in internal Russian affairs for the purpose of upholding the Constituent Assembly whose members are friends of Great Britain, even with Russian troops. Shortly afterwards intervention is begun and carried out by British troops and money, for and on behalf of men whose sole desire is to re-establish Tsardom or a military dictatorship” (Justice, 9 January 1919).

9 Labour Leader, 17 July 1919.
10 H.J. Stenning, born Heinrich Strobel, translated a wide range of works, including The Resurrection of the Dead, by the Swiss theologian Karl Barth.
11 Labour Leader, 15 January 1920.
12 Labour Leader, 22 January 1920.
14 The Guild Socialist, April 1921.
15 The Guildsman, November 1919.
16 The Guildsman, June 1918.
17 The Guildsman, July 1918.
18 The Guildsman, August 1918. On the importance of white-collar workers, see also the January 1919 issue, which welcomed “the tendency of brain workers to join the Labour Party” and commented: “We congratulate the Labour Party on welcoming them.” Under a subheading, “The Salariat,” the paper announced that there was “every indication that clerks and typists are at last beginning to see the folly of regarding themselves as members of the ruling class.”
19 The Guildsman, September 1918.
20 The Guildsman, February 1919.
21 The Herald, 4 January 1917.
23 The Guildsman, January 1921. It was the issue of September 1919 that referred to “Chesterbloc” as “friendly critics,” ones whose “wide community of outlook... on many points transcends our differences. Mr Belloc and Mr Chesterton both believe profoundly in human freedom and see clearly that economic freedom is the key to other sorts of freedom.” Their answer to the “Servile State” was promoted by the Distributist League, partly on the basis of Catholic social doctrine, which urged the virtues of a society comprised of small property owners. It is interesting that, during the 2010 British general election campaign, when the Conservative leader, David Cameron, was promoting the idea of the “Big Society” as an alternative to an allegedly over-large state, Jonathon Rabin traced the inspiration of Phillip Blond’s Red Tory — for whose ideas, Rabin said, Cameron was a “mouthpiece”

24 *The Guildsman*, April 1920. In his autobiography, *As It Happened*, Reckitt remembered John (or J.M.) Paton as a “the finest propagandist the National Guilds League ever had” (167). This John Paton should not be confused with the John Paton of *Left Turn!* who was to play a memorable role in the 1921 ILP conference debate on affiliation to the Comintern and later became secretary of that party.

25 *The Guildsman*, January 1918.

26 *The Guildsman*, July 1918.

27 *The Guildsman*, October 1918.

28 *The Guildsman*, July–August 1919. The voting figures given were 78 to 39. The vote by local group rejected the proposed change even more decisively, by 10 to 50.


30 Penty, by profession an architect, later became a Distributist. He is mainly remembered for his 1906 book, *The Restoration of the Guild System*, and as a contributor, during the pre-war period, to A. R. Orage’s *The New Age*.


32 *The Guildsman*, June 1920.


34 *The Guildsman*, May 1919.


39 *New Statesman*, 13 March 1920. The other two books reviewed in the same article were Colonel Malone, MP, *The Russian Republic*, and W.T. Goode, MA, *Bolshevism at Work*.

40 *The Socialist*, 30 January 1919. “Comrade Martoff,” that is, Julius Martov (1873–1923), was one of the preeminent leaders of the Mensheviks.

41 *The Socialist*, 12 February 1920.

42 *The Call*, 22 April 1920.

43 Karl Kautsky, *The Dictatorship of the Proletariat*, 42.

44 *Workers’ Dreadnought*, 8 May 1920. The spelling of Kautsky’s name in the “Letter” was erratic; in other places, he appeared as “Kautzki.”


46 *The Communist*, 12 February 1921.

47 *New Statesman*, 18 December 1920. Regarding Russell, the reviewer claimed: “What shocks Russell is the religious nature of Bolshevism as a result of which they show contempt of democracy, freedom of speech and of the Press.”

48 *The Communist*, 6 August 1921.
CHAPTER 7
The Dictatorship of the Proletariat

1 Karl Kautsky, The Dictatorship of the Proletariat, 43.
2 Justice, 8 December 1913.
3 The Call, 12 and 29 July 1917.
4 Workers’ Dreadnought, 24 August 1918.
5 Workers’ Dreadnought, 14 June 1919.
6 The Socialist, December 1918.
7 Workers’ Dreadnought, 17 May 1919.
8 The Call, 30 October 1919.
9 The Socialist, 28 October 1920. Gregory Zinoviev (1883–1936) was a prominent Bolshevik, who chaired the executive committee of the Third International. In 1936, he became one of the “Old Bolshevik” victims of Stalin’s first show trial.
10 The Call, 4 April 1918.
11 Walter Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, 1900–21: The Origins of British Communism, 406, n. 59. Andrew Rothstein, Theodore’s son, told Kendall that his father had used this pseudonym during 1918.
12 The Call, 26 September 1918.
13 The Socialist, 24 December 1919.
14 The Call, 24 October 1918.
15 Workers’ Dreadnought, 8 February 1919. Lenin’s “A Letter to American Working-men” first appeared in Pravda, on 22 August 1918.
16 The Communist, 12 August 1920.
17 The Communist, 2 December 1920.
18 Workers’ Dreadnought, 17 May 1919.
19 Workers’ Dreadnought, 1 March 1919.
20 Workers’ Dreadnought, 3 August 1918.
21 The Call, 13 February 1919.
22 Charles Roden Buxton (1875–1942) was a former Liberal MP who had come to the ILP via the Union of Democratic Control. In 1920, he would be one of the secretaries of the Labour Party/TUC delegation that visited Russia. He was later a parliamentary adviser to the Labour Party and, for two quite brief periods (1922–23 and 1929–31), a Labour MP.
23 Labour Leader, 15 May 1919.
24 Workers’ Dreadnought, 8 November 1919.
25 Workers’ Dreadnought, 5 May 1919.
26 The Call, 19 February 1920.
27 Workers’ Dreadnought, 17 July 1920.
28 The Communist, 29 April and 13 May 1922.
29 The Call, 22 July 1920. See also the previous week’s issue (15 July), in which the “Theses of the Executive Committee of the Communist International” denounced as “a surrender to those views of syndicalism, industrialism which are in essence reactionary” the declaration of the German Left Communists at their founding
conference that they were not creating a party in the “usual, traditional sense of
the word (Keine Partei im überlieferten Sinne).”

30 The Guildsman, October 1919.
31 The Guildsman, November 1919 (Reckitt) and December 1919 (Dutt).
32 Justice, 12 June 1919.
33 Workers’ Dreadnought, 12 April 1919.
34 The Call, 13 November 1919.
35 The Call, 22 April 1920.
36 The Socialist 15 January 1920.
37 Workers’ Dreadnought, 3 July 1920.
38 Workers’ Dreadnought, 24 and 31 July 1920.
39 New Statesman, 26 February 1921.

CHAPTER 8
The Independent Labour Party and the Third International: A Crucial Test
for Belief in Soviet Democracy

1 For membership estimates, see Walter Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Brit-
ain, 1900–21: The Origins of British Communism, 269; and Philip Viscount Snowden,
2 Laurence Thompson, The Enthusiasts: A Biography of John and Katharine Bruce
Glasier, 230.
4 Labour Leader, 22 May 1919.
5 Labour Leader, 14 August (MacDonald) and 28 August 1919 (Longden).
6 Labour Leader, 4 September (MacDonald) and 11 September 1919 (Longden).
   Described by David Howell as “an old-style ILP propagandist,” Fred Longdon
   had been imprisoned as a conscientious objector during the war. In the 1920s,
   he became a full-time lecturer in the Workers’ Educational Association, an adult
   education movement that has survived into the twenty-first century, and was a
   Labour MP for a Birmingham constituency in 1929–31 and 1945–52. See David
   Howell, MacDonald’s Party: Labour Identities and Crisis, 1922–1931, 244.
7 Labour Leader, 16 October 1919.
8 David Marquand, Ramsay MacDonald, 257.
11 Labour Leader, 1 April 1920.
12 Labour Leader, 11 December 1919.
13 Labour Leader, 18 December 1919.
14 Labour Leader, 1 January (Johnson) and 5 February 1920 (Cole).
15 Labour Leader, 29 January 1920.
16 Labour Leader, 12 February 1920.
17 Labour Leader, 8 January 1920.
18 Labour Leader, 12 February 1920.
19 Ibid.
20 Labour Leader, 19 February 1920. For Fred Jowett’s pre-war advocacy of the “Bradford Resolution” and the replacement of the cabinet with a committee system, see Logie Barrow and Ian Bullock, Democratic Ideas and the British Labour Movement, 1880–1914, especially chap. 10.
21 Labour Leader, 15 January 1920.
22 The Socialist, 24 January 1920.
23 For the earliest such occasions, see Barrow and Bullock, Democratic Ideas and the British Labour Movement, 81.
24 Labour Leader, 26 February 1920.
25 Labour Leader, 15 April 1920.
27 Labour Leader, 8 April 1920. All quotations are from Labour Leader’s report on the conference, by “Our Special Correspondent,” who paraphrased many of the arguments made by the speakers. Herron, the mover of the affiliation motion, is described in the report simply as “Herron (Preston),” but his first initial was probably “W.”
29 Labour Leader, 8 April 1920.
30 Labour Leader, 15 April 1920.
32 George Lansbury, What I Saw in Russia, xiv. According to Jonathan Schneer, Lansbury’s book counteracted the prevalent anti-revolutionary propaganda and “stimulated greater pro-Russia feeling” (George Lansbury, 92).
33 Labour Leader, 1 April 1920.
36 Labour Leader, 13 May 1920.
37 Labour Leader, 17 June 1920. Ben Turner (1863–1942), eventually Sir Ben Turner, was a leading trade unionist and later a Labour MP.
38 Saville, “The British Labour Delegation to Russia, 1920” 259. For the reaction of the government, see White, Britain and the Bolshevik Revolution, 15.
39 Labour Leader, 8 July 1920. A.A. Purcell (1872–1935) had chaired the first meeting of the Industrial Syndicalist League in 1910 (Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, 144). Workers of All Countries? Syndicalism, Internationalism and the Lost World of A.A. Purcell, the final volume of Kevin Morgan’s Bolshevism and the British Left trilogy, focuses on Purcell’s life and activities. The advance notice for the volume states: “At different times in his life Purcell was a marxist local councillor, a syndicalist, a trade union officer, a Communist, a guild socialist and a Labour MP. He was part of a tradition of indiscriminate militancy which looked on Bolshevism as merely its boldest manifestation.”

NOTES TO PAGES 195–202
Daily Herald, 12 July 1920.

Labour Leader, 22 July 1920.

Daily Herald, 7 July 1920.

Daily Herald, 12 July 1920. Bertrand Russell had this to say of Williams: “Robert Williams, I found, was very happy in Russia, and was the only one of our party who made speeches pleasing to the Soviet Government. He always told them that a revolution was imminent in England, and they made much of him. I told Lenin he was not to be trusted, and the very next year, on Black Friday, he ratted” (The Autobiography of Bertrand Russell, vol. 2, 1914–1944, 102). On Williams’s role in “Black Friday,” see n. 43 to chapter 2.

Labour Leader, 22 July and 19 August 1920.

The Socialist, 12 August 1920.

Labour Leader, 16 September 1920.

Daily Herald, 7 July 1920.

Labour Leader, 1 July 1920. L. Haden Guest had been joint secretary, with Charles Roden Buxton, of the delegation visiting Russia.

Labour Leader, 15 July 1920.

Daily Herald, 2 July 1920.


Laybourn, Philip Snowden, 86.

The Socialist, 13 May 1920.

Labour Leader, 6 May 1920; for Rogers’s letter, see the issue of 22 April.

Labour Leader, 2 December (Snowden) and 23 December 1920 (Parker).

Labour Leader, 10 February and 31 March 1921.

The Socialist, 9 December 1920.

Labour Leader, 3 March 1921.

Labour Leader, 10 March 1921.

Labour Leader, 17 March 1921.

The Socialist, June 1918.

Labour Leader, 13 January 1921.

The Socialist, 13 January 1921.

Labour Leader, 31 March 1921. Note that the report used “(Hear, hear)” to indicate that a particular statement provoked vocal support from the audience.

John Paton, Left Turn! The Autobiography of John Paton, 86. The irony, Paton went on to explain, was that he was already “at this time extremely critical of MacDonald.”

Labour Leader, 31 March 1921.

The Communist, 2 April 1921.

Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, 276.

Labour Leader, 22 April 1921.
CHAPTER 9
“An Infantile Disorder”: Communist Unity and the Brief Life of the Communist Party (British Section of the Third International)

1 See Logie Barrow and Ian Bullock, Democratic Ideas and the British Labour Movement, 1880–1914, chaps. 1, 4, 10, and 12.
3 Workers’ Dreadnought, 7 December 1918.
4 Workers’ Dreadnought, 14 December 1918.
5 Workers’ Dreadnought, 2 November 1918.
6 Workers’ Dreadnought, 21 September 1918.
7 Workers’ Dreadnought, 29 March and 12 April 1919 (editorial by Sylvia Pankhurst, “The Soviets Reach Bavaria”).
8 Workers’ Dreadnought, 26 July and 23 August 1919.
9 Workers’ Dreadnought, 27 March 1920.
10 Workers’ Dreadnought, 7 August 1920.
11 Workers’ Dreadnought, 26 June 1920.
12 Workers’ Dreadnought, 14 and 21 June 1919.
14 See Barbara Winslow, Sylvia Pankhurst, Sexual Politics and Political Activism, 145–46.
15 Workers’ Dreadnought, 26 April 1919.
16 Workers’ Dreadnought, 21 February 1920.
17 See Davis, Sylvia Pankhurst, 77–79.
18 The Socialist, 15 January 1920.
19 The Call, 22 January 1920.
20 The Call, 5 February and 22 April 1920.
21 For the Pauls’ support of Pankhurst’s views, see The Call, 4 March 1920. For their argument regarding her letter, see Solidarity, February 1920.
22 Gallacher’s letter appeared in the 21 February 1920 issue of the Dreadnought. It was this letter that Lenin quoted at length in “Left-Wing” Communism, patronizingly commending it for the “temper and point of view of the young Communists, or of rank-and-file workers who are only just coming to Communism.” (Gallacher was thirty-eight at the time.) In Lenin’s view, Gallacher’s letter revealed “the rudiments of all the mistakes that are being made by the German ‘Left’ Communists and were made by the Russian ‘Left’ Bolsheviks in 1908 and 1918.” See V.I. Lenin, “Left-Wing” Communism: An Infantile Disorder, 79–80.
23 The Call, 4 March 1920.

Workers’ Dreadnought, 8 May 1920. For a more complete version of the statement of the Amsterdam Sub-Bureau, see Kendall, *The Revolutionary Movement in Britain*, 210.


Workers’ Dreadnought, 22 May 1920.


*The Call*, 10 June 1920.

Workers’ Dreadnought, 12 June 1920.

These are the organizations mentioned in the 12 June issue of the Dreadnought. Mark Shipway has “Holt” rather than “Hull” but otherwise provides the same list, as well as furnishing details about some of these very small groups. See Shipway, *Anti-Parliamentary Communism: The Movement for Workers’ Councils in Britain, 1917–45*, 11–12.

The South Wales Socialist Society (SWSS) seems to have become a branch of the SLP about this time. See Kendall, *The Revolutionary Movement*, 385, n. 1, and also Raymond Challinor, according to whom the South Wales organization had decided to “dissolve into the SLP” (*The Origins of British Bolshevism*, 240). See also A.E. Cook’s claim, in *The Communist*, 30 September 1920, that former SWSS members held a conference that was addressed by Edgar Whitehead, the secretary of the CP (BST). So the precise fate of the SWSS remains unclear.

Workers’ Dreadnought, 26 June 1920. The August unity conference, which took place in London, officially opened on 31 July.


Ibid., 12.

Workers’ Dreadnought, 3 July 1920.

*The Call*, 8 July 1920.

*The Call*, 22 July 1920.

Gallacher makes no mention of Pankhurst in *Revolt on the Clyde* (1936), although he does say that Lenin made him “an outstanding example of ‘Left’ sectarianism in “Left-Wing” Communism” (251). But in his later book, *The Rolling of the Thunder* (1947), he offers an account of how the offending letter found its way into Pankhurst’s paper.

The Communist, 16 September 1920.

*Solidarity*, August 1920. See *The Socialist*, 1 July 1920, for its attack on Pankhurst.

Workers’ Dreadnought, 25 September 1920. The letter, which spanned two issues, was concluded the following week, in the 2 October edition.

New Statesman, 11 December 1920.

Workers’ Dreadnought, 4 September 1920.


Workers’ Dreadnought, 11 September 1920.

Ibid.

The Communist, 30 September 1920.

Workers’ Dreadnought, 25 September 1920.

As we saw earlier, in reporting on the Cardiff conference, Whitehead credited the dramatic speech that helped to secure the party’s participation in the unity process simply to a “Comrade Leslie.” Although Kendall refers to a John Leslie, it seems rather unlikely that there were two Leslies simultaneously so active in the CP (BSTI).

CHAPTER 10
British Bolsheviks? The Socialist Labour Party

1 Raymond Challinor, The Origins of British Bolshevism, 206.
2 The Socialist, 24 December 1919.
3 See Challinor, The Origins of British Bolshevism, 215–24. For the identification of the SLP as Britain’s “Bolshevik” party, see 188, 192, 212, and 242.
4 The Socialist, May 1915.
5 The Socialist, 17 February 1921.
6 For Morris’s article, see The Socialist, March 1917. See also the issues of March 1916 and March 1918, which explicitly linked “Paris, March 1871” with “Russia 1917.” On 13 March 1919, the William Morris piece was once again given front-page treatment.
7 See The Socialist, 1 July, 22 July, and 5 August 1920, on Douglas, Tawney, and Postgate, respectively.
8 The Socialist, 8 July 1920.
9 The Socialist, 17 and 24 November 1921.
10 The Socialist, 28 April 1921.
11 The Socialist, April 1918.
12 The Socialist, 22 June 1922.
13 The Socialist, 12 May 1921. Walter Citrine (1887–1983) was to be the general secretary of the Trades Union Congress for more than twenty years, covering such crucial
periods as the General Strike of 1926 and World War II. His *A.B.C. of Chairmanship* — known to many simply as “Citrine” — became the established authority on the subject throughout the British Labour movement and more widely.


15 *The Socialist*, 8 July 1920 (Hen) and 10 March 1921 (Anderson).

16 See, for example, the editorial titled “Dawn of the Servile State,” in the May 1915 issue; A.E. Cook, “The Servile State or Freeland,” December 15; and the editorial “Why the SLP?” in the issue of 8 September 1921.

17 *The Socialist*, July 1915. If the account in the paper the previous month is to be believed, Holliday’s prime offence — which earned him, before the appeal, three months’ imprisonment with hard labour — was to mention in passing the German origins of the royal family. Sadly, he died the following year at the age of only forty-six. See *The Socialist*, June 1916.

18 Challinor, *The Origins of British Bolshevism*, 251. See also, for example, *The Socialist*, 2 September 1920 and 13 January 1921.

19 *The Socialist*, 24 February 1921.


21 See *The Socialist*, May 1923 and June 1923.

22 *The Socialist*, 11 August and 22 September 1921.

23 For the “Children’s Corner,” see *The Socialist*, 18 and 25 May and 8 June to 10 August 1922.

24 *The Socialist*, May 1915 (Stoker) and May 1918 (“Hero Worship”).


26 *The Socialist*, 24 March 1921.

27 *The Socialist*, 14 April 1921.

28 *The Socialist*, 22 September 1921. A “Bobby” was a policeman — the paper’s point being that if someone in the police force were trying to get ahead by investigating the party’s revolutionary activities, all they would need to do is ask for information.


30 *The Socialist*, November 1918.

31 *The Socialist*, 30 January and 6 February 1919.

32 *The Socialist*, 11 March 1920 (and see also the issue of 1 May 1919).


34 *The Socialist*, 15 April 1920.

35 *The Socialist*, 22 April and 6 and 13 May 1920.

36 *The Socialist*, 6 May 1920.

37 *The Socialist*, 1 July 1920.

38 *The Socialist*, 10 February 1921.

39 *The Socialist*, 25 August 1921.

40 See *The Socialist*, 18 August to 27 October. Some decades later, in the 1950s, James Clunie (1889–1972) would become a Labour MP.

41 *The Socialist*, 20 October 1921.

42 *The Socialist*, 27 October 1921.
The Socialist, January 1923. For Henderson on Lenin’s speech, see the issue of March 1923.

The Socialist, 17 April 1919.

The Socialist, 20 November 1919.

The Socialist, 26 August 1920.

The Socialist, 10 March 1921.

The Socialist, 19 January 1922.

The Socialist, 9 February 1922.

The Socialist, January 1923.

See Challinor, The Origins of British Bolshevism, 49–53.

Ibid., 271.

The Socialist, 13 October, 10 November, and 8 December 1921.

For Henderson’s critique, see The Socialist, 8 December 1921. The Sheffield announcement appeared in the issue of 19 January 1922.

The Socialist, 12 January 1922.

The Socialist, 12 January 1922.

The Socialist, 2 February 1922.

The Socialist, 8 December 1921.

The Socialist, 15 December 1921 (editorial note) and 23 February 1922 (Leslie).

The Socialist, 25 May 1922.

The Socialist, 16 February 1922.

The Socialist, 19 January 1922.

The Socialist, 25 August 1921.

The Socialist, 28 July 1921.

The Socialist, 4 and 11 August 1921.

The Socialist, 29 September 1921.

Raymond Challinor is withering about Campbell’s the lack of any real qualifications for this role (The Origins of British Bolshevism, 271). J.R. Campbell (1894–1969) came to national prominence in 1924, in the “Campbell Case,” when, as editor of the CPGB’s Workers’ Weekly, he was charged under the Incitement to Mutiny Act. The handling, or mishandling, of the case contributed to the demise of the first (minority) Labour government. Campbell remained a leading Communist for the rest of his life.

The Socialist, 9 February 1922.

The Socialist, 5 October 1922.

The Socialist, 3 April 1919.

The Socialist, 3 July 1919.

The Socialist, 8 April and 26 August 1920.

The Socialist, 3 February 1921.

The Socialist, 2 June 1921.

The Socialist, 15 September 1921, on Lusty and the Coventry branch, and 20 July 1922, on the defence of Sunday schools.

The Socialist, 1 and 8 September 1921.

The Socialist, 17 November 1921 and 5 January 1922.

The Socialist, 18 June 1922.
CHAPTER 11
Pankhurst’s Dreadnought and the (Original) Fourth International: “Left Communism” and Soviet Democracy

1. Workers’ Dreadnought, 2 and 16 April 1921.
2. Workers’ Dreadnought, 28 January 1922 and 10 February 1923.
3. Workers’ Dreadnought, 16 May and 16 July 1921.
4. Workers’ Dreadnought, 30 April 1921.
5. Workers’ Dreadnought, 2 April and 29 October 1921.
6. The first part of Gorter’s article appeared in the Dreadnought on 12 March and the final one on 21 May, but instalments were published somewhat sporadically in between, rather than at regular weekly intervals.
7. Workers’ Dreadnought, 30 July 1921.
8. Workers’ Dreadnought, 13 August 1921.
10. Workers’ Dreadnought, 3 September 1921. Early in July, the Dreadnought had adopted “Sovrussia” to refer to Soviet Russia, but the term did not survive for long.
11. For Pankhurst’s complete account of her expulsion, see the Workers’ Dreadnought, 17 September 1921.
12. See The Communist, 17 September and 8 October 1921.
14. Workers’ Dreadnought, 12 November 1921.
15. Workers’ Dreadnought, 30 April and 7 May 1921.
17. Workers’ Dreadnought, 8 October 1921.
19. Workers’ Dreadnought, 8 and 15 October 1921.
20. Workers’ Dreadnought, 10 December 1921.
21. Workers’ Dreadnought, 11 February 1922.
22. Workers’ Dreadnought, 11 March 1922.
23. Workers’ Dreadnought, 1 April 1922.
24. Workers’ Dreadnought, 3 June 1922.
25. Workers’ Dreadnought, 17 June 1922.
27. Workers’ Dreadnought, 4 November 1922.
28. Workers’ Dreadnought, 7 October 1922.
29. Workers’ Dreadnought, 27 November and 1 December 1923.
30. Workers’ Dreadnought, 5 January 1924.
31. Workers’ Dreadnought, 10 May 1924.
32. Workers’ Dreadnought, 12 April 1924.
33. Workers’ Dreadnought, 26 November and 3 December 1921.
34. Workers’ Dreadnought, 28 January 1922. On 10 March, Pankhurst again attacked Zinoviev’s thesis about the appropriate time to establish soviets.

392 NOT ES TO PAGES 276 – 90
35 Workers’ Dreadnought, 7 July 1923.
36 Workers’ Dreadnought, 21 July 1923.
37 Workers’ Dreadnought, 19 December 1921.
39 The Workers’ Dreadnought, 4 February 1922. Later, the establishment of workers’ councils in Austria by the Social-Democrats was seen as supporting the view that even “capitalists find them useful” and as another instance “of the fact that workers’ management of industry is not the impractical dream some ‘Socialists’ and ‘Communists’ would have us believe” (Workers’ Dreadnought, 25 March 1922).
40 The Workers’ Dreadnought, 10 June 1922.
41 Workers’ Dreadnought, 15 July 1922.
42 Workers’ Dreadnought, 10 May 1924.
43 Workers’ Dreadnought, 7 and 28 January 1922.
44 Workers’ Dreadnought, 1 April 1922.
45 Workers’ Dreadnought, 11 March 1922.
46 Workers’ Dreadnought, 18 November 1922.
47 Workers’ Dreadnought, 24 February 1923.
48 Workers’ Dreadnought, 28 April 1923.
49 Workers’ Dreadnought, 27 October 1922.
50 Workers’ Dreadnought, 2 February 1924.
51 Workers’ Dreadnought, 24 March 1924.
52 Workers’ Dreadnought, 7 January 1922.
53 Workers’ Dreadnought, 4 February 1922.
54 Workers’ Dreadnought, 4 March 1922.
55 Workers’ Dreadnought, 25 March 1922.
56 Workers’ Dreadnought, 20 May 1922.
57 Workers’ Dreadnought, 15 July 1922.
58 Workers’ Dreadnought, 26 August and 4 November 1922.
59 Workers’ Dreadnought, 10 May 1924.
60 Workers’ Dreadnought, 29 July 1922.
61 Workers’ Dreadnought, 19 August 1922.
62 Workers’ Dreadnought, 9 September 1922.
63 Workers’ Dreadnought, 17 February 1923.
64 Workers’ Dreadnought, 1 September 1923.
65 Workers’ Dreadnought, 18 February, 25 March, and 27 May 1922.
66 Workers’ Dreadnought, 9 June 1923.
67 Workers’ Dreadnought, 3 and 17 May 1924.
68 Workers’ Dreadnought, 7 July 1923.
69 Workers’ Dreadnought, 2 and 9 February 1924.
70 Workers’ Dreadnought, 15 March 1924.
71 Workers’ Dreadnought, 6 October 1923 and 5 April 1924.
72 Workers’ Dreadnought, 6 October 1923.
CHAPTER 12
The Early British Communist Party: Soviet Democracy Deferred and Redefined

1 The Call, 27 May 1920.
2 See The Communist, 1 July and 2 September 1922. Before this, the Dreadnought had concluded that the trial “smacks too much of political juggling to be anything but offensive to disinterested persons” (Workers’ Dreadnought, 24 June 1922). The trial has since been seen as the forerunner of Stalin’s “show trials”: see Marc Jansen, A Show Trial Under Lenin: The Trial of the Socialist Revolutionaries, Moscow 1922.
3 The Communist, 19 August 1922.
4 Workers’ Dreadnought, 2 August 1919. Reviewing M. Philips Price’s Reminiscences of the Russian Revolution in 1921, the New Statesman noted that “he is not only on the side of the Bolsheviks, he has even taken service under the Soviet Government and at one moment he offered himself as a volunteer for the Red Army” (New Statesman, 11 June 1921). Morgan Philips Price was the “Squire of Tibberton” and director of Price, Walker and Co. See M. Philips Price, “Blue Blood and Bolshevism: An Open Letter to the Workers of Gloucester, and One of Interest to Workers Everywhere. Received by the Chairman of Gloucester Branch I.L.P. and read at a public meeting at Gloucester, and subsequently published in full in the local press,” Gloucester ILP, 1920, (ILP Archives, London School of Economics, British Library of Political and Economic Science).
5 Workers’ Dreadnought, 17 May 1919.
6 A rare use of the term ergatocracy appeared in the Workers’ Dreadnought in 1923. The context was the coup in Bulgaria, facilitated, the paper argued, by the failure to democratize the army and police “on soviet lines”: “In passing it may be said that Army and Police Forces are inevitably the negation of democracy, even of what some people call ergatocracy.”
7 The Call, 5 February 1920.
8 The Communist, 12 August 1920.
10 The Call, 12 July 1917.
11 The Call, 24 October 1918.
12 The Communist, 9 September 1920.
13 The Communist, 26 August 1920.
14 The Communist, 5 November 1921.
15 Workers’ Weekly, 17 February 1923.
17 The Communist, 5 August 1920. George Young’s article, from which Montefiore was quoting, appeared in The Observer on 11 July 1920.
18 The Communist, 19 August 1920.
19 The Communist, 14 October 1920.
20 The Communist, 30 April 1921. Not so very unusually, William Mellor (1888–1942) had a varied career in left-wing politics. An Oxford graduate, he worked on Lansbury’s Herald, which he later edited, served as secretary of the Fabian Research Department in 1913–14, and was a founding member of the NGL and later of the
Guild Communist group. A conscientious objector during World War I, he was also a founding member of the CPGB but left the party in 1924. In the late 1930s, he would be the first editor of Tribune.


22 Kevin Morgan, Labour Legends and Russian Gold, vol. 1 of Bolshevism and the British Left, 41–53. See also his earlier Harry Pollitt, 26.

23 The Communist, 25 March 1922.

24 The Communist, 8 April 1922.

25 The Communist, 7 and 14 October 1922.

26 The Communist, 6 January 1923.

27 The Socialist, 15 January 1920.

28 The Socialist, 29 April 1920.

29 The Socialist, 6 May 1920.

30 Workers’ Dreadnought, 20 November 1920.

31 Workers’ Dreadnought, 27 November 1920.

32 Workers’ Dreadnought, 31 December 1920. For “Are We Realists?” see The Communist, 24 December 1921.

33 The Communist, 22 July 1922.


36 Workers’ Dreadnought, 2 August 1919.

37 Solidarity, January 1920 and February 1920.

38 Solidarity, 29 April 1921.

39 Ralph Darlington, The Political Trajectory of J.T. Murphy, 85.

40 The Communist, 6 May 1922.

41 Pat Sloan, Soviet Democracy, 9. Beatrice Webb wrote a preface to Sloan’s Russia Without Illusions, which appeared the following year. See also Peter Beilharz, Labour’s Utopias: Bolshevism, Fabianism, Social Democracy, 49. As Beilharz says: “The Bolshevik utopia exercised an extraordinary influence over socialist thinking.” (18).


43 Ibid., 222–23.

44 Ibid., 141–42 and 216.

45 The Call, 4 July 1918.


47 See Morgan, The Webbs and Soviet Communism, 11.


49 Morgan, The Webbs and Soviet Communism, 224.
CHAPTER 13
Endings and Conclusions

1 Labour Leader, 17 March 1921.
2 Labour Leader, 10 March 1921; The Communist, 12 March 1921.
3 Israel Getzler, Kronstadt, 1917–21: The Fate of a Soviet Democracy, 205.
4 Ibid., 249–50.
5 See Charles Read, From Tsar to Soviets: The Russian People and Their Revolution, 1917–21, 276.
6 The Socialist, 17 March 1921.
7 The Socialist, 2 and 9 June 1921.
8 The Socialist, 7 July 1921.
9 Workers’ Dreadnought, 16 April 1922.
10 Raymond Postgate, The Life of George Lansbury, 203.
11 Workers’ Dreadnought, 30 December 1922. Alexander Berkman (1870–1936) had been deported from the United States to Russia early in 1917, together with his partner and collaborator Emma Goldman (1869–1940) and over two hundred others.
12 Workers’ Dreadnought, 9 February 1924.
13 Workers’ Dreadnought, 23 February 1924. The first part of Gorter’s article (9 February 1924) was prefaced by “Translated from German,” which may explain why the city is referred to as “Petersburg” rather than the more usual (at that time) “Petrograd.”
14 Workers’ Dreadnought, 9 June 1923.
15 Workers’ Dreadnought, 24 March 1923 and 26 January 1924.
16 Workers’ Dreadnought, 2 February 1924.
21 Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, 299–300.
22 McIlroy and Campbell, “Nina Ponomareva’s Hats,” 153. For a full account of the role of Moscow gold in the CPGB’s finances, see Morgan, Labour Legends and Russian Gold.
23 Solidarity, 13 May 1921.
25 Kevin Morgan, The Webbs and Soviet Communism, vol. 2 of Bolshevism and the British Left, 49. Morgan cites Maurice Reckitt, As It Happened, 146–47. The list overlaps with the “study circle” that met at the Coles’ home starting in May 1919, the members of which are listed in John S. Peart-Binns, Maurice B. Reckitt: A Life, 48. Common to both groups are Page Arnot, A.L. Bacharach, Ivor Brown, Raymond Postgate, and the Coles themselves.
26 Reckitt, As It Happened, 181.
28 The Guildsman, 9 June 1920.
29 The Guild Socialist, June 1922.
31 The Socialist, 11 August and 1 December 1921.
32 The Socialist, 5 January, 2 February, and 22 June 1922.
33 See The Socialist, 10 August (the Glasgow branch won a book) and 5 October 1922. In its October announcement, the paper said that it looked forward to resuming weekly publication at some future date. It also pointed out, encouragingly, that the monthly edition offered good value — sixteen pages for only tuppence.
34 Workers’ Dreadnought, 7 October 1922 and 10 March 1923.
35 Workers’ Dreadnought, 24 March 1923.
36 Workers’ Dreadnought, 28 April and 5 May 1923.
37 Workers’ Dreadnought, 4 August and 1 December 1923.
38 Workers’ Dreadnought, 27 October 1923. Gondor is probably best known for his work in child psychology, first in Europe and, later, in the United States.
39 Workers’ Dreadnought, 19 April 1924.
40 The 21 October 1922 issue of the Dreadnought seems to be the first in which “Printed by S. Corio” appeared.
41 Workers’ Dreadnought, 9 September 1922.
42 Workers’ Dreadnought, 4 November and 16 December 1922. The Herald’s attitude towards fascism was again under attack in the issue of 20 January 1923.
43 Workers’ Dreadnought, 3 February and 31 March 1923.
44 Workers’ Dreadnought, 24 February, 17 and 24 March, and 26 May 1923.
45 Workers’ Dreadnought, 1 December 1923.

NOTES TO PAGES 339–44
46 Workers' Dreadnought, 5 January and 2 February 1924.
47 Workers' Dreadnought, 3 May 1924.
49 Justice, 1 and 22 January 1925.
50 H.W. Lee and E. Archbold, Social-Democracy in Britain: Fifty Years of the Socialist Movement, 263.
51 Ibid., 266.
52 Ibid., 270.
53 Labour Leader, 17 July 1919.
54 Labour Leader, 25 November 1920.
56 Labour Leader, 2 December 1920.
57 Labour Leader, 2 and 9 December 1920.
58 Labour Leader, 2 December 1920.
59 Labour Leader, 30 December 1920.
60 Labour Leader, 13 January 1921.
61 Labour Leader, 31 March, 14 April, and 7 July 1921.
62 Labour Leader, 16 June 1921.
63 See Thompson, The Enthusiasts, 233–43.
67 David Marquand, Ramsay MacDonald, 277.
68 Marwick, Clifford Allen, 79.
69 Brockway, Inside the Left, 145.
71 Brockway, Inside the Left, 143. For Brailsford’s salary, see Marquand, Ramsay MacDonald, 277; for Glasier’s, see Thompson, The Enthusiasts, 230.
72 Workers’ Dreadnought, 7 April 1923.
74 Dowse, Left in the Centre, 71.
75 Kendall, The Revolutionary Movement in Britain, 300.
76 Ralph Darlington, The Political Trajectory of J.T. Murphy, 24.
77 On the “president/chairman” issue in the ILP, see Logie Barrow and Ian Bullock, Democratic Ideas and the British Labour Movement, 1880–1914, 79–81; on the Clarion federation, see ibid., chaps. 5 and 6.
78 For SDF opposition to “Fabianistic Caesarism,” see ibid., 38–43.
79 Justice, 15 March 1884.
80 See Justice, 24 and 31 January 1903, and 23 and 30 June 1906.
81 On Hyndman being censored and his “dominance” of the SDF, see Barrow and...


83 Bax’s “Democracy and the Word of Command” was originally published in The Social-Democrat, May 1898, and was later included in his Essays in Socialism: Old and New (London: Grant Richards, 1907).

84 Justice, 9 March 1901.

85 Workers’ Dreadnought, 24 November 1917.

86 Workers’ Dreadnought, 8 February 1919.

87 The Call, 19 June (Willis) and 6 November 1919 (Dell).

88 Daily Herald, 7 September 1920.

89 The Call, 8 April 1920.

90 The Call, 3 June 1920.

91 The Communist, 2 December 1920.

92 Daily Herald, 7 July 1920; New Statesman, 24 January 1920.


94 New Statesman, 19 June 1920. Shaw had compared Lenin and Churchill some time before this. See the Workers’ Dreadnought, 7 February 1920, and The Call, 12 February 1920, for reports on Shaw’s lecture, “Socialism and the Labour Party,” at the Kingsway Hall, under the headlines “Bernard Shaw Applauds Lenin” and “Bernard Shaw on Bolshevism,” respectively.

95 New Statesman, 13 March 1920.

96 The Communist, 14 October 1922. For the full quotation, see chapter 12 at note 25.

97 See Morgan, Labour Legends and Russian Gold, for a full account of the role of the latter commodity in the CPGB’s finances.

98 The Socialist, 10 February 1921.

99 The Communist, 10 December 1921; The Socialist, 5 January 1922.

100 On the unclear and mixed origins of soviets in 1905, see Madhavan K. Palat, “Police Socialism in Tsarist Russia, 1900–1905.”

101 See Barrow and Bullock, Democratic Ideas and the British Labour Movement, 30–43 and 165–66; the 1906 Special Committee report is quoted at greater length on 165.

102 Justice, 22 June and 7 September 1901.

103 The Clarion, 16 and 23 December 1910.

104 Darlington, The Political Trajectory of J.T. Murphy, 261.

105 Lee and Archbold, Social-Democracy in Britain, 252–63.

106 The term council communism appears to have been in use from 1921 (see Marcel van der Linden, “On Council Communism,” 27), but Pankhurst and the Dreadnought do not seemed to have used the expression.

107 Mark Shipway, Anti-Parliamentary Communism: The Movement for Workers’ Councils in Britain, 1917–45, 201.

108 Getzler, Kronstadt, 1917–21, 258.