NOTES

Archives frequently cited are identified by the following abbreviations:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BCA</td>
<td>British Columbia Archives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPC</td>
<td>VCA, Vancouver Board of Police Commissioners Papers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC</td>
<td>VCA, City Clerks’ Papers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCM</td>
<td>VCA, Add. Mss. 576, Central City Mission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FS</td>
<td>VCA, Financial Services Paper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JWJ</td>
<td>BCA, J. W. Jones Papers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MO</td>
<td>VCA, Papers of the Mayor’s Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PW</td>
<td>City of Victoria Archives, CRS 28, Public Works Committee Records</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFT</td>
<td>UBCSC, Premier Simon Fraser Tolmie Papers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TDP</td>
<td>BCA, Add. Mss. 3, Thomas Dufferin Pattullo Papers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UBCSC</td>
<td>University of British Columbia, Special Collections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UW2</td>
<td>VCA, Add. Mss. 849-2, United Way of the Lower Mainland Papers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VCA</td>
<td>Vancouver City Archives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VPD</td>
<td>VCA, Vancouver Police Department Papers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VSS</td>
<td>VCA, Vancouver Social Service Department Papers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Preface


2. On the different ways of seeing the homeless, the radical Marxist professor Bill Livant has quipped: “A liberal sees a beggar on the street and says the system is not working. A Marxist sees a beggar on the street and says it is.” Quoted in Bertell Ollman, *How 2 Take an Exam . . . And Remake the World*, 95.


Introduction: From Fordlandia to Hobomia

2 Henry Ford and Samuel Crowther, Today and Tomorrow, 224.
3 Benjamin B. Lovett, “Good Morning”: Music, Calls, and Directions for Old-Time Dancing as Revived by Mr. and Mrs. Henry Ford, 3.
4 David Harvey, The Condition of Postmodernity, 125–26.
5 David Montgomery, “White Shirts and Superior Intelligence.”
6 John Dos Passos, The Big Money, 48. Dos Passos wrote The Big Money in 1936 as the third novel of a trilogy. The three books were published together in 1938 by Harcourt Brace under the title U.S.A.

10 On totality, see Fredric Jameson, The Political Unconscious: Narrative as a Socially Symbolic Act, 17–102. This concept, as Jameson uses it, bears no resemblance to the postmodern critique of Marxism’s supposed “totalization” of history.
11 August Meier and Elliott Rudwick, Black Detroit and the Rise of the UAW, 3–33.
12 Grandin, Fordlandia, 356.
13 On self-undermining utopias, see Karla Schultz’s fascinating article, “Utopias from Hell: Brecht’s Mahagonny and Adorno’s Treasure of Indian Joe.”
14 Walter Benjamin, “On the Concept of History.”
15 Ruth Roach Pierson, “Experience, Difference, Dominance and Voice in the Writing of Canadian Women’s History,” 89–93. I will be forever grateful to Nancy Forestell for bringing this to my attention.
16 The self-congratulatory tone of much of this historiography is observed, for example, in Bryan D. Palmer, “Of Silences and Trenches: A Dissident View of Granatstein’s Meaning.”
17 F. R. Ankersmit, “Historiography and Postmodernism.”
18 I have poached the concept of “Theoryworld” from Susan Buck-Morss. See Thinking Past Terror: Islamism and Critical Theory on the Left, 8.
20 Frank Tobias Higbie, Indispensable Outcasts: Hobo Workers and Community in the American Midwest, 1880–1930, 176 (my emphasis).
21 There are also parallels with the alternative unionism and unemployed activism of the decade. The American historiography on this subject is extensive; excellent places to start are Staughton Lynd, ed., “We Are All Leaders”: The Alternative Unionism of the Early 1930s, and James J. Lorence, Organizing the Unemployed: Community and Union Activists in the Industrial Heartland.
22 My understanding of primitive accumulation, both under capitalism and in the hobo jungles, has been greatly influenced by Stephen Hymer, “Robinson Crusoe and the Secret of Primitive Accumulation,” and Bryan D. Palmer, A Culture in Conflict: Skilled Workers and Industrial Capitalism in Hamilton, Ontario, 1860–1914, 3–18, and “Social Formation and Class Formation in North America, 1800–1900.”
23 Connell’s critique of Althusserian and post-Althusserian practice and of the various forms of reproduction theory, written in the late 1970s and 1980s, form the background for many of his influential socialist feminist arguments in Gender and Power (1987). Given E. P. Thompson’s similar positions on structuralism as well as
his suggestive comments on women's history during the same period, I believe that this is one of the more significant “missed articulations” (the term is Douglas Kellner’s) of the twentieth century, and we are all the poorer for it. Despite this demonstrable fact, we will be closer to understanding Thompson’s oeuvre once we connect it to Connell. See R.W. Connell, Which Way Is Up? Essays on Class, Sex and Culture, and Gender and Power; Society, the Person, and Sexual Politics.

Let me here both apologize and express my gratitude to Andy Parnaby, my housemate for three years in Kingston and Vancouver, who listened to me talk of Kipnis endlessly. More to the point, his work on the 1930s began before and greatly influences mine. See Andrew Parnaby, “What’s Law Got to Do with It? The IWA and the Politics of State Power in British Columbia, 1935–1939”; Andrew Parnaby and Andrew Neufeld, The IWA in Canada: The Life and Times of an Industrial Union; Andrew Parnaby, Citizen Docker: Making a New Deal on the Vancouver Waterfront, 1919–1939; and his ongoing research on working-class comestible consumption in Blubber Bay. See, for example, Dennis Guest, The Emergence of Social Security in Canada, and John Taylor, “‘Relief from Relief’: The Cities’ Answer to Depression Dependency.”

It is important to note that Keynesian spending was always limited in the post-war era. See Doug Owram, The Government Generation, Canadian Intellectuals and the State, 1900–1945, and Robert Campbell, Grand Illusions: The Politics of the Keynesian Experience in Canada, 1945–1975.

The classic work on the business community as an obstacle to genuine reform is Alvin Finkel, Business and Social Reform in the Thirties. On the liberal reform impulse in British Columbia during the 1930s, see Robin Fisher, Duff Pattullo of British Columbia, and Margaret A. Ormsby, “T. Dufferin Pattullo and the Little New Deal.”


The obvious exception is Finkel, Business and Social Reform in the Thirties.

One important exception to this is Marcus Klee’s work on “relief capitalism.” Some industries, he persuasively argues, viewed municipal and provincial spending as a subsidy, allowing them to lower wages. Government relief, in this way, helped to foster sweat labour. Marcus Klee, “Fighting the Sweatshop in Depression Ontario: Capital, Labour and the Industrial Standards Act.”

Jameson, The Political Unconscious, 10. In my reading of Jameson, I am under the powerful influence of Clint Burnham, The Jamesonian Unconscious: The Aesthetics of Marxist Theory. Relatedly, the retrospective illusion of the metacommentary thus has the advantage of allowing us to measure the yield and density of a properly Marxist interpretive act against those of other interpretive methods — the ethical, the psychoanalytic, the myth-critical, the semiotic, the structural, and the theological — against which it must compete in the “pluralism” of the intellectual marketplace today. I will here argue the priority of a Marxian interpretive framework in terms of semantic richness. Marxism cannot today be defended as a mere substitute for other methods, which would then be triumphalistically consigned to the ashcan of...
history; the authority of such methods springs from their faithful consonance with this or that local law of a fragmented social life, this or that subsystem of a complex and mushrooming cultural superstructure. In the spirit of a more authentic dialectical tradition, Marxism is here conceived as that “untranscendable horizon” that subsumes such apparently antagonistic or incommensurable critical operations, assigning them an undoubted sectoral validity within itself, and thus at once cancelling and preserving them. Ben Reitman, quoted in Nels Anderson, *The Hobo: The Sociology of the Homeless Man*, 87.


Nicholas Klein, quoted in Tim Cresswell, *The Tramp in America*, 49.

Anderson classifies homeless men into five types: “(a) the seasonal worker, (b) the transient or occasional worker or hobo, (c) the tramp who ‘dreams and wanders’ and works only when it is convenient, (d) the bum who seldom wanders and seldom works, and (e) the home guard who lives in Hobohemia and does not leave town.” Anderson, *The Hobo*, 63.

Andrew Roddan, for example, cited Anderson’s *The Hobo* in *God in the Jungles* (1931), republished as *Vancouver’s Hoboes*, 25.

It is commonplace knowledge that North American and British women, such as Boxcar Bertha, periodically passed themselves off as men on the road and in the jungles, to mask their identities and as a strategy to avoid danger. Unfortunately, I have located no evidence of this phenomenon in this context. For an excellent discussion, see Cresswell, *Tramp in America*, 97–109.

In this context, a male household head whose family did not reside in Vancouver could apply for and receive aid in that jurisdiction and then hit the road to scrounge for himself, allowing the often inadequate relief allotment to be distributed among the remaining family members. Stanley Hutcheson, in *Depression Stories*, claims that such a practice extended to those preparing to head to war in the late 1930s, citing cases in which men and women married so as to allow the woman access to the man’s income.


Todd McCallum, “‘Not a Sex Question’? The One Big Union and the Politics of Radical Manhood” and “The Strange Tale of Tom Cassidy and Catherine Rose, or, Free Love, Heterosexuality and the One Big Union.”

My interpretation is influenced by Paul Jackson’s unpublished doctoral research on the relief camps, conducted at the same time that I was researching chapter 5. He is not implicated in my conclusions, of course. A brief glimpse of Jackson’s research can be obtained in *One of the Boys: Homosexuality in the Military During World War II*, 156–57.

As far as I can tell, the first scholar to make such an argument is Marion Elizabeth Lane, “Unemployment During the Depression: The Problems of the Single Unemployed Transient in British Columbia, 1930–1938.” See also, in chronological order, Bettina Bradbury, “The Road to Receivership: Unemployment and Relief in Burnaby, North Vancouver City and District and West Vancouver, 1929–1933”; John Douglas Belshaw, “The Administration of Relief to the Unemployed in Vancouver During the Great Depression”; and Theresa Healy, “‘Trouble Enough’: Gender, Social Policy, and the Politics of Place in Vancouver and Saskatoon, 1929–1939.”

Lara Campbell argues,

It is images of men and of male unemployment that often frame the popular imagination of the “dirty thirties”: men standing in relief lines or in soup kitchens, men protesting on the streets, and men “riding the
rods” in search of work. But although such images symbolize the general hardship of the era, they hide and subsume gender conflicts, the crucial role of women’s domestic labour, and how the changing definitions of manhood shaped the experiences of men over time. Respectable Citizens: Gender, Family, and Unemployment in Ontario’s Great Depression, 57.

I disagree. While this description certainly applies to numerous individual accounts, on balance the research agenda of the past thirty years has focused more on family unemployment, and on familial relations more generally, than it has on the single homeless man — as it should — and this is true of Canada in addition to the vast American literature. The transient certainly remains an archetype, but cannot be considered the only one. As well, I do not assume that projects such as mine which do little to address gender conflicts automatically “hide and subsume” them.

Respectable Citizens: Gender, Family, and Unemployment in Ontario’s Great Depression, 57.


Fredric Jameson, Archaeologies of the Future: The Desire Called Utopia and Other Science Fictions, 16.

Boxcar Bertha, as told to Ben L. Reitman, Sister of the Road: The Autobiography of Boxcar Bertha.

Starting in 1931, applicants had to swear the following oath:

I [name] of [address] in the City of Vancouver, Province of British Columbia, do solemnly declare that my reason of application for registration under the scheme of the Provincial Government of British Columbia for the registration of the unemployed, is, that I am destitute, being without the necessities of life, and that neither I nor any of my dependents have any financial resources whatsoever. CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Chairman, Finance Committee, 13 January 1932.

In one sense, the relief industry bore similarities to processes associated with advertising. According to Sut Jhally, consumers of television and other media work while watching the obligatory advertising. This work by the watcher is, in fact, what is sold by advertising agencies and media corporations to the owners of industries that produce the goods and services to be advertised. Like the spectator, the relief recipient had to offer something in exchange. Sut Jhally, “Probing the Blindspot: The Audience Commodity,” and The Codes of Advertising: Fetishism and the Political Economy of Meaning in the Consumer Society.

For liberal scholarship on these processes, see David Monod, Store Wars: Shopkeepers and the Culture of Mass Marketing, 1890–1939, and Daniel Robinson, The Measure of Democracy: Polling, Market Research, and Public Life, 1930–1945. In this area, as in others, materialist analyses are the best in the field: in addition to Parnaby, Citizen Docker, and for a sampling of new Canadian accounts, see Donica Belisle, “A Labour Force for the Consumer Century: Commodification in Canada’s Largest Department Stores, 1890–1940”; Cynthia Comacchio, “Mechanomorphosis: Science, Management, and ‘Human Machinery’ in Industrial Canada, 1900–1945”; and James Wishart, “Class Difference and the Reformation of Ontario Public Hospitals, 1900–1935: ‘Make Every Effort to Satisfy the Tastes of the Well-to-Do.’” Frederick Winslow Taylor himself claimed that “the same principles can be applied with equal force to all social activities: to the management of our homes; the management of our farms; the management of the business of our tradesmen, large and small; of our churches, our philanthropic institutions, our universities, and our governmental departments.” Quoted in Robert Kanigel, The One Best Way: Frederick Winslow Taylor and the Enigma of Efficiency, 438–39.
For the intellectual context of the rationalization of charity in Canada, I have relied on Marlene Shore, *The Science of Social Redemption: McGill, the Chicago School, and the Origins of Social Research in Canada*.


Karl Marx, “The Secret of Primitive Accumulation.”


Bill Waiser’s *Park Prisoners: The Untold Story of Western Canada’s National Parks, 1915–1946* contains much valuable detail about the administrative structures maintained by government spending on unemployment relief and internment projects.

See, for instance, Peter Ward, *White Canada Forever: Popular Attitudes and Public Policy Toward Orientals in British Columbia*.


Walter Benjamin, “An Outsider Makes His Mark.”

Eric Lott, “Perfect Is Dead: Karen Carpenter, Theodor Adorno, and the Radio; Or, If Hooks Could Kill”; David Jenemann, *Adorno in America*. We owe much to Jenemann for his excellent work in situating Adorno wholly within the American culture industry.

Jameson began with “T.W. Adorno; or, Historical Tropes,” which opens as follows: To whom can one present a writer whose principal subject is the disappearance of the public? What serious justifications can be made for an attempt to summarize, simplify, make more widely accessible a work which insists relentlessly on the need for modern art and thought to be difficult, to guard their truth and freshness by the austere demands they make on the powers of concentration of their participants, by their refusal of all habitual response in their attempt to reawaken numb thinking and deadened perception to a raw, wholly unfamiliar real world?

Ariel Dorfman, “The Infantilization of the Adult Reader.”


Quoted in “Interview with Michel Foucault,” 273, in *Michel Foucault: Power*, 239–97.

Ibid., 274.

See “Interview with Michel Foucault,” 276–77, in which Foucault claims that Frankfurter School philosophers did not conduct historical research: “They are eaters of history as others have prepared it. They consume it preprocessed.”

Encounter with Marxism,” and “The Scientific Method and the Dialectical Method.”


Governmentality is Foucault’s term for the modalities of administration and control through which modern European states govern their populations at many levels, including the political, the legal, as well as the biological (through the provision of health care), and penal realms.

Rationalization is a complex modernization process that refers to a tendency of the corporate or managerial class in contemporary capitalist societies to reshape traditions, values, and human emotions/behaviours through the employment of rational, predictable, and efficient planning methods. The result of this process is a profound alteration in the patterns of collective and individual life.

Chapter 1: A Strike, a Conference, and a Riot

1. Theodor W. Adorno, Minima Moralia: Reflections from a Damaged Life, 42 (emphasis in original).


4. “Vancouver Millionaire.”

5. Ibid.


8. “State of emergency” is from Thesis VIII of Benjamin’s “On the Concept of History.”

9. I have not found any other examples of municipal endorsements of non-contributory unemployment insurance, but according to Alvin Finkel (pers. comm.) the election of Communists to City Council in Blairmore, Alberta, later in the 1930s may have resulted in such.


14. Vancouver Sun, 4 December 1929.


16. Vancouver Sun, 30 October 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 21 November 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 30 October 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 28 November 1929.
“New Prosperity Era Here,” Vancouver Sun, 21 December 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 31 December 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 2 November 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 29 October 1929.
CC, series 20, box 14-F-5, file 4, G.D. Ireland to A.J. Pilkington, 30 October 1929.
CC, series 20, box 15-A-1, file 1, Report of the Special Committee on the Finances of the Relief Department, 7 November 1929.
CC, series 20, box 14-F-1, file 10, W. Page to City Council, 28 November 1929.
CC, series 20, box 14-F-3, file 14, Percy Bengough to City Council, 16 February 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 14 November 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 15 November 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 26 November 1929.
CC, series 20, box 14-F-5, file 4, C. Maxwell to G.D. Ireland, 16 April 1930.
CC, series 20, box 14-F-5, file 4, Summary of Unemployed Single and Married Men as per Relief Department Reports to Council, n.d. [April 1930].
CC, series 20, box 15-B-4, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 11 July 1930.
CC, series 20, box 14-F-5, file 4, C. Maxwell to George Ireland, 16 April 1930; G.D. Ireland to A.J. Pilkington, 17 April 1930.
BPC, series 180, box 75-A-2, file 1, Minutes of a Regular Meeting, 7 November 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 28 September 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 24 October 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 1 November 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 4 December 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 30 and 31 December 1929.
VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Frank Godber to Inspector Thomson, 7 January 1930.
Vancouver Sun, 12 November 1929.
Vancouver Sun, 4 December 1929.
I have maintained the spelling and grammar of the original documents save for examples where comprehension is impossible. In these cases, I have placed my letter or word substitutions within square brackets.
VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Report of Detectives MacDonald and Corbett, 4 December 1929 (emphasis in original).
“Unemployed on Parade,” Vancouver Daily Province, 5 December 1929; Vancouver Sun, 6 December 1929.
Litterick was quoted the day before as saying, “It will be an orderly procession; if there’s any trouble, it won’t come from us.” “’On to Moscow’ Parade Fixed,” Vancouver Daily Province, 4 December 1929.
The best work on the Communist Party’s unemployed activism in Vancouver is John Manley, “‘Starve, Be Damned!’: Communists and Canada’s Urban Unemployed, 1929–1939.”
“Jobless Men Now Seek Union Rates,” Vancouver Daily Province, 10 December 1929.

“In early childhood I saw the first snow-shovellers in thin shabby clothes. Asking about them, I was told they were men without work who were given this job so that they could earn their bread. Then they get what they deserve, having to shovel snow, I cried out in rage, bursting uncontrollably into tears.” Adorno, “Monograms,” in Minima Moralia, 190.

“Urge Work Under Grading By-Law,” Vancouver Daily Province, 13 December 1929; Vancouver Sun, 17 December 1929. The $4.50 figure cited by Bennett conflicted with the figure cited by Atherton in the initial meeting with VUWO delegates. Because union wages for outdoor workers ranged from just under $4.00 to $4.60, neither figure should be regarded as inaccurate or implying a change in position.

See Bingham’s report to the Board of Police Commissioners, dated 10 December 1929.

“Unemployed Ask $4.50 ‘Cash Money,’” Vancouver Daily Province, 16 December 1929.


“The Unemployed,” Vancouver Daily Province, 17 December 1929; Vancouver Sun, 17 December 1929.

Vancouver Sun, 18 December 1929; “Urge No Change in Policy of Relief Work,” Vancouver Daily Province, 18 December 1929.

Vancouver Sun, 18 December 1929.

CC, series 20, box 14-F-7, file 17, J. Litterick and W. McEwan to City Council, 18 December 1929; “Urge No Change in Policy of Relief Work.”

“Two Paraders Are Arrested,” Vancouver Daily Province, 20 December 1929; Vancouver Sun, 20 December 1929.

BPC, series 181, box 75-C-2, file 14, W. J. Bingham to Board of Police Commissioners, 7 February 1930.

Unemployed Worker, 28 December 1929.

VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Report of Detectives Rae and Fletcher, 30 December 1929 (emphasis in original).

VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Report of Daniel Dorroch, 2 January 1930.

VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Report of John Mackenzie, 10 January 1930.

VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Report of Special Constable Frank Godber, 31 December 1929.

VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Capt. Jervis to Chief Constable Bingham, 21 December 1929.


VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Report of PC Eric Hichens to Chief Constable, 30 December 1929.

VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Report of PC Eric Hichens to Inspector Thomson, 2 January 1930.

VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Capt. George Ash to Inspector Thomson, 31 December 1929.

VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Unemployment Record, “Scotty” Simpson, 24 December 1929.

VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Report of PC Eric Hichens to Inspector Thomson, 12 January 1930.

VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 8, Frank Godber to Inspector Thomson, 7 January 1930.

Notes 259
On third-party movements, see John Herd Thompson, with Allen Seager, *Canada 1922–1939: Decades of Discord*. 

---

Notes

doi:10.15215/aupress/9781926836287.01
Chapter 2: “Useless Knowledge” About Jungle Life

1 Edmond Kelly, *The Elimination of the Tramp by the Introduction into America of the Labour Colony System Already Proved Effective in Holland, Belgium, and Switzerland, with the Modifications Thereof Necessary to Adapt This System to American Conditions*, 15.


4 R.M., “Death of a Derelict” (my emphasis).

5 For another story that connects poverty, suffering, and contortions of the body, see Franz Kafka’s “A Hunger Artist.”

6 Kelly, Elimination of the Tramp, 9.

7 Todd DePastino, Citizen Hobo: How a Century of Homelessness Shaped America, 15.

8 In the Canadian context, see Reinhold Kramer and Tom Mitchell, Walk Towards the Gallows: The Tragedy of Hilda Blake, Hanged, 1899, 106–18.


10 Theodor Adorno addressed Romanticism as follows:

   The Romanticized concept of the proletariat assigns the “task of salvation” to the latter, because it is supposed to stand outside the nexus of social guilt, whilst suppressing the fact that it is dependent on the social mechanism. The Romantic concept is complemented here by the no less Romantic notion that society would be able to regenerate itself if only it could find its way back to its unsullied origins. . . . Wagner falsifies the condition of the disinherited by misrepresenting the oppressed man as an un mutilated one. “God and Beggar,” 120.


12 Norbert MacDonald, Distant Neighbors: A Comparative History of Seattle and Vancouver; Robert A. J. McDonald, Making Vancouver: Class, Status, and Social Boundaries, 1863–1913.


15 SFT, box 3, file 18, H.T. Whitehead, Secy, Committee of the Executive Council on Unemployment Relief, to Premier S.F. Tolmie, 11 April 1933.


18 On the Unemployment Relief Act of 1930, see Struthers, No Fault of Their Own, 47–50.

19 VSS, series 451, box 107-F-1, Registration Book.

20 CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 3, W.R. Bone to Mayor Taylor, 25 July 1932. Numerical breakdowns by age, length of residence in Vancouver and Canada, nationality, fitness, and military service were included with Bone’s memorandum.

21 Michel Foucault, An Introduction, 135–59.

22 Ibid., 138–39 (emphasises in original).
On the claim that “population” enabled governmentality, see Michel Foucault, Security, Territory, Population: Lectures at the Collège de France, 1977–1978, 101–10. In the English-speaking academy, governmentality was introduced through The Foucault Effect, which reprinted his lecture of 1 February 1978 and several interviews as well as studies by people in his seminar. See Graham Burchell, Colin Gordon, and Peter Miller, eds., The Foucault Effect: Studies in Governmentality.


Bruce Curtis, “Foucault on Governmentality and Population: The Impossible Discovery,” 509.


Ibid., 41–43.


Conley, “Frontier Labourers.”


Barbara Roberts, Whence They Came: Deportation from Canada, 1900–1935.

BPC, series 181, box 75-C-4, file 18, W.J. Bingham to Mayor and Board of Police Commissioners, 21 January 1931.

Andrea Graziosi, “Common Laborers, Unskilled Workers, 1880–1915.”


Martha Millet, “Women of Spain,” 63.

“Reissue, repackate, repackage” is a line from the song “Paint a Vulgar Picture,” found on The Smiths’ 1987 album Strangeways, Here We Come (Rough Trade Records).

Every reasonably aware person of our time is aware of the obvious fact that art can no longer be justified as a superior activity, or even as a compensatory activity to which one might honorably devote oneself. The reason for this deterioration is clearly the emergence of productive forces that necessitate other production relations and a new practice of life. . . . It is in fact necessary to eliminate all remnants of the notion of personal property in this area. The appearance of new necessities outmodes previous “inspired” works. They become obstacles, dangerous habits. The point is not whether we like them or not. We have to go beyond them. Any elements, no matter where they are taken from, can be used to make new combinations. Guy Debord and Gil Wolman, “A User’s Guide to Détournement.”

On the effects on the human body of periodic fasting, see Sharman Apt Russell, Hunger: An Unnatural History.

Andrew Roddan, Vancouver’s Hoboes, 17.

Ibid., 18.


Sydney Scott, “Vancouver Jungles and Their Denizens,” Vancouver Province, 6 September 1931.


CC, series 20, box 15-D-1, file 18, J.W. McIntosh to Mayor and City Council, 24 June 1931.
Be honest: have you caught yourself thinking “at least they’re in False Creek”?


VCA, Matthews Collection, box 503-C-3, K.J. Burns to Frank Waters, 3 August 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-E-1, file 2, George Buscombe to A.J. Pilkington, 28 October 1931. Buscombe claimed that his warehouse had been divided and taken to the Harbour Board jungle and to a jungle on the False Creek flats. For the correspondence on the Union St. warehouse, see the following, all found in box 15-E-1, file 2: A.W. Buscombe to A.J. Pilkington, 15 October 1932; Memorandum covering Solicitor’s Ruling, 27 October 1932; A.J. Pilkington to A.W. Buscombe, 28 October 1932; A.W. Buscombe to City Clerk, 8 November 1932; George Buscombe to A.J. Pilkington, 8 November 1932; George Buscombe to City Clerk, 14 November 1932.

J. Sydney Williamson, “Jobless Pour into Vancouver and City Pays to Feed Them,” Vancouver Sun, 3 November 1930.

Ibid.

On the broad contours of provincial economic development, see the essays in Rennie Warburton and David Coburn, eds., Workers, Capital, and the State in British Columbia.

“BC Plan Would Relieve Municipalities from Care of Floaters,” Vancouver Province, 16 June 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-1, file 18, J.W. McIntosh to Mayor and City Council, 24 June 1931.

Ibid.

Roddan, Vancouver’s Hoboes, 18.

Ibid., 19.

Ibid., 18-20.

VCA, Matthews Collection, box 503-C-3, Waters to Vancouver Harbour Commissioners, 20 July 1931.


VCA, Matthews Collection, box 503-C-3, Waters to Vancouver Harbour Commissioners, 27 July 1931. Waters maintained that “none of the men belonging to the camp on your property” had participated, but the evidentiary basis for this statement is not clear.

Waters’s lists of names are found in VCA, Matthews Collection, box 503-C-3.

VSS, series 450, box 106-C-2, file 1, H.W. Cooper to W.C. Atherton, 3 September 1931.

Ibid.


There are theoretical and methodological parallels in Foucault’s frequent return to the concept of the “event” as that which establishes discontinuities or breaks and generates new dispositifs — an obvious attempt to disrupt the smooth surfaces of French structuralism — and Thompson’s analysis of the “conjuncture” in Whigs and Hunters and historical process in “The Poverty of Theory.” Michel Foucault, “The Discourse on Language”; Foucault, Security, Territory, Population; E.P. Thompson, Whigs and Hunters: The Origins of the Black Act, and “The Poverty of Theory: Or an Orrery of Errors.”

Vancouver Daily Province, 16 June 1931.

“Jungle Crew Are Well Fed,” Vancouver Province, 26 June 1931.

Roddan, God in the Jungles, plate between pp. 8 and 9.

Sam Roddan, Batter My Heart, 75–78.

Vancouver School of Theology, First United Church Papers, box 3, Annual Reports, Year Ending December 31st 1931, Miss H.A. Johnston, Report of Secretarial Department, 15.

doi:10.15215/aupress/9781926836287.01

264 Notes
Vancouver School of Theology, First United Church Papers, box 3. Annual Reports, Year Ending December 31st 1930, Miss H.A. Johnston, Report of Secretarial Department, 34; Annual Reports, Year Ending December 31st 1931, Miss H.A. Johnston, Report of Secretarial Department, 16. If accurate, these figures suggest that Roddan’s claim to have fed fifty thousand homeless men is exaggerated, as it would mean that most only received a single meal.

Vancouver’s Hoboes, 77–78.

VCA, Matthews Collection, box 503-C-2, Frank Waters to Vancouver Harbour Commissioners, 17 July 1931.


VCA, Matthews Collection, box 503-C-2, Frank Waters to Vancouver Harbour Commissioners, 17 July 1931.


VCA, Matthews Collection, box 503-C-3, K.J. Burns to Mrs. E.W. Hamber, 10 August 1931.

See, for instance, Gareth Stedman Jones, Outcast London: A Study in the Relationship Between Classes in Victorian Society, and Anne McClintock, Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest.

“Structure of feeling” is taken from Raymond Williams, Marxism and Literature.

VCA, Matthews Collection, box 503-C-2, Colonel R.D. Williams to J.S. Matthews, 30 September 1931. The quotation comes from a handwritten notation made by Major Matthews on this letter.

“Vancouver Jungles and Their Denizens.”

Ibid.

Ibid., 98.

Ibid., 86.

Ibid., 30–31.

On organizations related to the unemployed in the Lower Mainland, see Bettina Bradbury, “The Road to Receivership: Unemployment and Relief in Burnaby, North Vancouver City and District and West Vancouver, 1929–1933,” esp. 62–64, 70–72, 140–42; John Manley, “‘Starve, Be Damned!’ Communists and Canada’s Urban Unemployed, 1929–1939”; and Todd McCallum, “‘Still Raining, Market Still Rotten’: Homeless Men and the Early Years of the Great Depression in Vancouver.”

Stanley Hutcheson, Depression Stories, 64.

Ibid., 61.

For examples of hoboes supporting a group until their resources were exhausted, see B.C., “Down in Con’s,” The Worker, 23 January 1932; Hutcheson, Depression Stories, 59–62; One of Them, “Riding the Rods Proves Easy If You Know the Ropes,” Vancouver Daily Province, 3 August 1931; and A. Bundle-Stiff, “The Old Lumberjack,” The Worker, 6 July 1929.

Hutcheson, Depression Stories, 60.

“Vancouver Jungles and Their Denizens.”

Hutcheson, Depression Stories, 27.

G.H. Westbury, Misadventures of a Working Hobo in Canada, 89.

One of Them, “Riding the Rods.”

Notes 265

doi:10.15215/aupress/9781926836287.01
100 Hutcheson, Depression Stories, 61.
101 Ibid.
103 There is a wonderful online collection of Canadian hobo signs at Canadian Geographic, http://www.canadiangeographic.ca/magazine/ma01/indepth/hobo/hobolistlisting.asp.
104 Hutcheson, Depression Stories, 65.
105 Ibid.; Carey McWilliams, Factories in the Field: The Story of Migratory Farm Labor in California. For a discussion of the proletarianization of farm labour in the Canadian context, see Cecilia Danysk, Hired Hands: Labour and the Development of Prairie Agriculture, 1880–1930.
107 For a similar story, see Hutcheson, Depression Stories, 32.
108 The Man and Boys of a “Degraded Moral Type” may have been a wolf/ punk coupling. See DePastino, Citizen Hobo, 85–91; Frank Tobias Higbie, Indispensable Outcasts: Hobo Workers and Community in the American Midwest, 1880–1930, 123–27; and Steven Maynard, “Queer Musings on Masculinity and History,” esp. 191–97.
109 VCA, CC, series 20, box 15-C-6, file 4, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 8 September 1931.
110 VCA, Matthews Collection, box 503-C-2, Waters to Vancouver Harbour Commissioners, 20 July, 27 July, 4 August, and 9 September 1931.
111 Ibid.
112 Imprints of a Jungle Tour Through Canada,” The Worker, 17 October 1931.
113 VCA, CC, series 20, box 15-D-1, file 18, Dr. J. W. McIntosh to Mayor and City Council, 24 June 1931.
114 Ibid.
115 Ibid.
116 Ibid.
117 VCA, Matthews Collection, box 503-C-3, Waters to G. W. Head, 29 July 1931; G. W. Head to J. K. Burns, 30 July 1931: Waters to Vancouver Harbour Commissioners, 3 September 1931. The man and boys of a “degraded moral type” may have been a wolf/ punk coupling. See DePastino, Citizen Hobo, 85–91; Frank Tobias Higbie, Indispensable Outcasts: Hobo Workers and Community in the American Midwest, 1880–1930, 123–27; and Steven Maynard, “Queer Musings on Masculinity and History,” esp. 191–97.
118 Ibid.
119 VCA, CC, series 20, box 15-D-1, file 18, Dr. J. W. McIntosh to Mayor and City Council, 24 June 1931.
120 Ibid.
121 Ibid.
122 Ibid.
123 Ibid.
124 Ibid.
125 Ibid.
126 The Worker, 25 July 1931.
127 Ibid.
128 Ibid.
129 Ibid.
In an article on Canadian unions and welfare from 1950 to 1965, Shirley Tillotson offers a defence of the limited vision and autocratic decision-making power of a bureaucratically encased union leadership. Her defence is based on the necessity of effective action by “experts” within the constraints of context, seen as a “paradox endemic in all attempts to induce autonomous action in others.” This normalization of what was then the Canadian union movement’s most hierarchical and bureaucratically-organized organizations at their moment of becoming so in the name of efficiency of action is an example of means-ends rationalization inherent to Fordist-era liberal categories of analysis: how can this framework measure (or even locate) the efficiency of self-directed, autonomous actions in a context without any formalized institutions or leaders? Tillotson argues,

Rather than making the measure of union democracy be an erasure of difference between leaders and led, with such an erasure’s real costs to some kinds of strategic effectiveness, the hallmarks of good democratic practice might be a leadership system that generates, not just a single “opposition” party, but multiple organizational foci of leadership, so as to foster regenerative criticism of and change in the personnel and the tactical approaches of the labour bureaucracy. “‘When Our Membership Awakens’: Welfare Work and Canadian Union Activism, 1950–1965,” 168, 167.

A similar defence of some of the hierarchical and disciplinary character of the leadership of social welfare organizations can be discerned in Tillotson’s Contributing Citizens: Modern Charitable Fundraising and the Making of the Welfare State, 1920–1966.
Michel Foucault, *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences*, xix.

Michel Foucault, “Different Spaces,” in *Michel Foucault: Aesthetics, Method, and Epistemology*, 178. In this lecture, Foucault positions the mirror as a “kind of mixed, intermediate experience” between utopias and heterotopias. Regarding the former, he writes: “Utopias are emplacements having no real place. They are emplacements that maintain a general relation of direct or inverse analogy with the real space of society, but in any case these utopias are spaces that are fundamentally and essentially unreal.” My reading of this piece is influenced by Edward Soja, *Postmodern Geographies: The Reassertion of Space in Critical Theory*, 16–21.

“Bodies and their pleasures” references the arguments concerning the body in Foucault’s *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*, and *An Introduction*, the first volume of *The History of Sexuality*; “subjugated knowledges” appears in Foucault’s first lecture at the Collège de France in 1976, published in English translation in *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972–1977*; “limit-experiences” appears in several places, my preference being “Interview with Michel Foucault”; and “counter discourses” appears in lectures and publications dating from the late 1970s and early 1980s. All of these are discussed in the best of the biographies, David Macey’s *The Lives of Michel Foucault: A Biography*. See also Didier Eribon, *Insult and the Making of the Gay Self*, and David Halperin, *Saint Foucault: Towards a Gay Hagiography*, esp. 126–85.


“Sensuous human activity, practice” is from Marx’s “Theses on Feuerbach,” quoted in Francis Wheen, *Karl Marx*, 93.


See especially Neil Brenner, “Foucault’s New Functionalism,” which differentiates Foucault’s analysis from liberal and other forms of functionalism.

On the early history of the concept of “unemployment” in Canada, see Peter Baskerville and Eric Sager, *Unwilling Idlers: The Urban Unemployed and Their Families in Late Victorian Canada*.

Michel Foucault, “Different Spaces,” in *Michel Foucault: Aesthetics, Method, and Epistemology*, 181.

Ibid., 184.

Karl Marx, cited in Fredric Jameson, *Archaeologies of the Future: The Desire Called Utopia and Other Science Fictions*, 144. Award yourself bonus points if you predicted that this quote would appear in this book.

For the argument that Marx envisioned the realm of freedom as existing only in a post-capitalist society, see Ian McKay, “The Many Deaths of Mr. Marx: Or, What Left Historians Might Contribute to Debates About the ‘Crisis of Marxism’,” esp. 42. For the more positive version, in which the realm of freedom was thought to exist (in certain contexts) alongside that of necessity, see Ian McKay, *Rebels, Reds, Radicals: Rethinking Canada’s Left History*, 11–13.

I have made this argument in reference to the writings of Reverend Andrew Roddan in “The Reverend and the Tramp, Vancouver, 1931: Andrew Roddan’s *God in the Jungles*.”


Ibid., xi.
Chapter 3: The Crucifixion Machine and the Quest for Efficiency


5. On civic relief under Ireland, see Diane Matters, “Public Welfare Vancouver Style, 1910–1920.”


9. See for example, Maurutto, Governing Charities; Valverde, “Some Remarks.”

10. By “quasi-Marxist knowledge,” I mean to indicate accounts not explicitly identified as Marxist in provenance but which rely on (consciously or not) Marxist tools and can help to further Marxist interpretations.

11. Mariana Valverde, “The Mixed Social Economy as a Canadian Tradition.” An important exception is James Pitsula, whose work takes into account the different market arrangements with which relief was provided. See his “The Mixed Social Economy of Unemployment Relief in Regina During the 1930s.”

12. It is important to note that the much-criticized account of Harry Braverman took into account developments in office work. See Labor and Monopoly Capital: The Degradation of Work in the Twentieth Century.

13. VCA, City Council Minutes, MCR 1-31, 31 December 1930; CC, series 20, box 15-A-6, file 7, William McQueen to R.B. Bennett, 31 December 1930.


15. VCA, City Council Minutes, MCR 1-30, Meeting of the City Council, 7 April 1930.


17. H.W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 28 July 1930; CC, series 20, box 15-B-4, file 1, Memorandum from Premier S.F. Tolmie Relative to Unemployment and Relief in the City of Vancouver, n.d. [August 1930].

18. “Gov’t Asked to Halt Influx of Unemployed,” Vancouver Sun, 4 November 1930.

19. CC, series 20, box 15-B-4, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 13 October, 2 September, 24 November 1930.


22. H.W. Cooper, Memorandum re the Unemployment Relief Act 1930 and Its Operation in Vancouver.


24. The best account of the problems with the Unemployment Relief Act, 1930 in British Columbia’s Lower Mainland is Bettina Bradbury, “The Road to Receivership: Unemployment and Relief in Burnaby, North Vancouver City and District and West Vancouver, 1929–1933.” For national overviews, see Struthers, No Fault of Their Own, 47–50, and Thompson, with Seager, Canada 1922–1939, 209–13.

Notes
H. W. Cooper, Memorandum re the Unemployment Relief Act 1930 and Its Operation in Vancouver.

CC, series 33, box 26-D, vol. 61, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 24 November 1930.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H. W. Cooper to Alderman A. G. Harvey, 25 February 1932.

For details of this diversion of funds, see VSS, series 450, box 106-C-2, file 1, Report of Hamilton Crisford and J. T. Gawthrop re Investigation of Relief Administration, City of Vancouver, n.d. [spring 1935].

CC, series 20, box 15-B-4, file 1, H. W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 6 October 1930.

CC, series 20, box 15-B-4, file 1, H. W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 15 September 1930.

CC, series 20, box 15-B-4, file 1, H. W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 14 November 1930.


VCA, City Council Minutes, MCR 1-31, Meeting of the City Council, 2 March 1931.

This is discussed in further detail in chapter 5.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-4, file 9, H. W. Cooper, Memorandum re Unemployment, 27 March 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-4, file 9, H. W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 9 and 23 March 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-C-4, file 2, R. E. Timmins to City Clerk, 14 March 1931; City Clerk to Relief and Employment Committee, 17 March 1931; Vancouver Council, NUWA, to City Council, 18 March 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 21 March 1931.

John Belshaw, “The Administration of Relief to the Unemployed in Vancouver During the Great Depression.”

CC, series 33, box 26-D, vol. 61, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 25 January 1932.

VSS, series 450, box 106-C-2, file 1, H. W. Cooper to Mayor Taylor, 20 June 1932.

Compare with, for instance, the account of Toronto’s relief system during the same period, in Maurutto, Governing Charities, 71–75.

Later in the decade, when transient families became sufficient in number to merit their own classification, the residency distinction remained the first applied, resulting in substantive disparities in relief provision between resident and transient families.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-6, file 8, Committee of the Executive Council on Unemployment Relief, Circular re Registration of Unemployed, 23 July 1931; VCA, City Council Minutes, MCR 1-32, Meeting of the City Council, 25 August 1931.

VSS, series 450, box 106-C-2, file 1, H. W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 25 August 1931.

See Lorne Brown, When Freedom Was Lost: The Unemployed, the Agitator, and the State, and Bill Waiser, Park Prisoners: The Untold Story of Western Canada’s National Parks, 1915–1946.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-4, file 11, H. W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 2 October 1931.


Report of Hamilton Crisford and J. T. Gawthrop re Investigation of Relief Administration.

Max Horkheimer and Theodor W. Adorno, Dialectic of Enlightenment: Philosophical Fragments, 33.
On the transformation being “mostly dialectical”:
If Benjamin said that history had hitherto been written from the standpoint of the victor, and needed to be written from that of the vanquished, we might add that knowledge must indeed present the fatally rectilinear succession of victor and defeat, but should also address itself to those things which were not embraced by this dynamic, which fell by the wayside — what might be called the waste products and blind spots that have escaped the dialectic. Theodor W. Adorno, “Bequest,” in Minima Moralia, 151.


These are all references from Minima Moralia: avarice, “Le nouvel aware,” 35; luxury, “Auction,” 120; masochism, “Diagnosis,” 123–24 (although there are many others); tact, “On the dialectic of tact,” 35–37; solidarity, “Cat out of the bag,” 51.

See, for example, the complaints of civic politicians in MO, series 483, box 33-B-2, file 1, W. L. Woodford and W. R. Bone to Mayor Taylor, 25 August 1932.

For examples, see CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, which contains Colonel Cooper’s biweekly reports for the winter and spring of 1932.

VSS, series 449, box 106-A-6, file 2, L. D. McDonald to Mayor and Members of Relief Committee, 4 February 1935.


For a sample of complaints made to elected officials, see MO, series 483, box 33-B-2, file 1.

CC, series 33, box 26-D, vol. 61, Meeting of the Relief and Employment Committee, 18 May 1931.

CC, series 53, box 28-B-3, file 4, W. A. Tucker, Final Section of Report on Special Investigation of the Relief Department, City of Vancouver, BC, 1 October 1935, 11.

CC, series 33, box 26-D, vol. 61, Meeting of the Relief and Employment Committee, 7 November 1932.

W. R. Bone Diary, 6 June and 10 June 1933, quoted in CC, series 53, box 28-B-3, file 2, W. A. Tucker, Interim Report on Special Investigation of City Relief Department, City of Vancouver, Vancouver, BC, 16 September 1935, 14. Tucker’s report, especially the Interim Report, quoted verbatim from private diaries maintained by Bone. The diaries themselves have not been located, and thus it is not possible to situate Tucker’s excerpts within their broader context.

CC, series 20, box 15-A-6, file 2, Motion of the Executive of the Vancouver Central Ratepayers Association, n.d. [May 1930]. For another ratepayers’ campaign against inefficiency, see the motion of the Charles Dickens Ratepayers’ Association of Ward 7, in CC, series 20, box 16-A-4, file 12, D. R. Campbell to City Council, 16 September 1933.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-4, file 11, H. W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 9 November 1931.

Ibid.

MO, series 483, box 33-B-2, file 1, Report of Special Committee re Intensive Investigation of Relief Cases, 29 August 1932, 5.

Ibid., 6.
MO, series 483, box 33-B-2, file 1, W.R. Bone to Mayor Taylor, 5 August 1932; Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee re Intensive Investigation of Relief Cases, 11 August 1932; MO, series 483, box 33-B-2, file 4, W.R. Bone to Mayor Taylor, 22 September 1932; W.A. Tucker, Interim Report on Special Investigation, 23–36 (emphasis in original).

W.A. Tucker, Interim Report on Special Investigation, 23.


CC, series 20, box 15-C-4, file 5, H.W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 19 October 1931.

“Radical Change in City Relief Needed,” Vancouver Sun, 26 January 1932.

VSS, series 450, box 106-B-5, file 6, Department of Social Service, Budget Estimates, 1933.

Ibid.

VSS, series 449, box 106-A-6, file 2, Questionnaire re Administrative Staff of Vancouver City Relief Department, 27 May 1935.

See, for example, the breakdown of estimated versus actual costs in VSS, series 450, box 106-B-5, file 6, City of Vancouver, Estimates 1932.

Ibid.

MO, series 483, box 33-B-2, file 1, W.R. Bone to Mayor Taylor, 15 July 1932.

CC, series 20, box 14-F-5, file 4, The Handling of Meal and Other Tickets, n.d.


FS, series 299, box 93-A-2, file 17, Memorandum of W.A. Sheppard, 15 September 1930.

“Central Buying Scheme Approved,” Vancouver Sun, 7 November 1930; VCA, City Council Minutes, MCR 1-31, Minutes of the City Council, 15 December 1930.

Questionnaire re Administrative Staff of Vancouver City Relief Department, 27 May 1935.

VSS, series 450, box 106-B-2, file 5, Memorandum of Relief Officer W.R. Bone, 15 August 1933.

Questionnaire re Administrative Staff of Vancouver City Relief Department, 27 May 1935.

MO, series 483, box 33-B-2, file 1, W.R. Bone to Mayor Taylor, 5 August 1932.

VSS, series 450, box 106-C-2, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Mayor Taylor, 20 June 1932.


On office technology, see Graham Lowe, “Mechanization, Feminization, and Managerial Control in the Early Twentieth-Century Canadian Office.”

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Alderman A.G. Harvey, 8 February 1932.

VCA, City Council Minutes, MCR 1-31, Meeting of the City Council, 31 December 1930.


John Dos Passos, The Big Money, 75.

Fredric Jameson offers a cogent analysis of the form of Dialectic of Enlightenment in relation to Adorno’s other works in Late Marxism: Adorno, or, the Persistence of the Dialectic. Horkheimer and Adorno, Dialectic of Enlightenment, 31.


CC, series 53, box 28-B-3, file 3, W.A. Tucker, A Resume of the Final Report on a Special Investigation of the City Relief Department, City of Vancouver, and findings therein, 28 September 1935, 1–2.

272 Notes
doi:10.15215/aupress/9781926836287.01
CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Finance Committee, 13 January 1932.

MO, series 483, box 33-B-2, file 4, Robert B.C. Mundy, “Special Instructions to Visitors,” 3 September 1932.

The number of sections would vary as modifications were made in subsequent years.

Ibid., 9.

VSS, series 449, Memorandum of Relief Officer W.R. Bone, 23 January 1932.

Ibid., “Special Instructions to Visitors,” 1.

Ibid., (emphasis in original).

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Chairman, Finance Committee, 13 January 1932.

VSS, series 450, box 106-C-2, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Mayor Taylor, 20 June 1932.

See Harry Braverman’s discussion of F.W. Taylor for a similar logic. Labor and Monopoly Capital, 85-123.

VCA, City Council Minutes, MCR 1-32, Meeting of the City Council, 15 February 1932.


VSS, series 449, box 106-B-2, file 5, Memorandum of Relief Officer W.R. Bone, 23 March 1933.

Mundy, “Special Instructions to Visitors,” 6.


W.A. Tucker, Final Section of Report, 7.

“Council Hears Maccabe Appeal,” Vancouver Sun, 10 November 1931.

“Both Sides Win in Relief Office Investigation,” Vancouver Sun, 13 November 1931.

Ibid.

W.A. Tucker, Final Section of Report, 3 (emphasis in original).


W.A. Tucker, Final Section of Report, 5.

Ibid., 5–6.

W.A. Tucker, Interim Report on Special Investigation, 3–4 (emphasis in original).

Ibid., 6.

MO, series 483, box 33-B-2, file 1, Report re Intensive Investigation of Relief Cases, 29 August 1932.

W.R. Bone Diary, 8 May 1933, quoted in W.A. Tucker, Interim Report on Special Investigation, 14.

W.R. Bone Diary, 4 July 1933, quoted in W.A. Tucker, Interim Report on Special Investigation, 14.

W.R. Bone Diary, 26 July and 16 August 1933, quoted in W.A. Tucker, Interim Report on Special Investigation, 8–10; W.A. Tucker, Final Section of Report, 6.

W.R. Bone Diary, December 1932 and January 1933, quoted in W.A. Tucker, Interim Report on Special Investigation, 12 (emphasis in original).

W.A. Tucker, Resume of the Final Report, 10.

W.A. Tucker, Final Section of Report, 61.

W.R. Bone Diary, 29 September, 3 October and 4 October 1933, quoted in W.A. Tucker, Interim Report on Special Investigation, 16–18.

W.A. Tucker, Final Section of Report, 5.


W.A. Tucker, Interim Report on Special Investigation, 22.
Chapter 4: The Racket in Tickets and the Traffic in Lives

2. MO, series 483, box 46-A-1, file 1, Mayor Gerald Grattan McGeer, Inaugural Address, 2 January 1935, 1.
3. See the handbills in SFT, box 5, file 15, Canadian Fascists: They Are Out for the New Deal!, 24 April 1933, and Fascists of Canada Proclamation, 1 May 1933.
5. Mayor Gerald Grattan McGeer, Inaugural Address, 1.
8. Mayor Gerald Grattan McGeer, Inaugural Address, 1.
12. FS, series 299, box 93-A-3, file 10, Memorandum of Chas Jones, City Clerk, for Select Committee on Provincial Finances, 14 May 1932.
13. It could be argued that municipalities were bound by law to provide relief. However, while municipal governments forced into bankruptcy, in part due to relief costs, were forced to endure the appointment of an administrator tasked with slashing spending, I know of no municipal government that suffered a similar fate for refusing to provide relief during the 1930s.
15. Unemployed Worker, 9 April 1932.
17. Dorothy Livesay, “Canada to the Soviet Union,” in Right Hand Left Hand, 72. The best recent analysis of Livesay’s work during this period (including this poem) is Candida Rifkind, Comrades and Critics: Women, Literature and the Left in 1930s Canada.
18. CC, series 20, box 15-D-2, file 5, S. Marriomatis to City Relief Committee, 28 February 1931.
19. CC, series 20, box 15-B-3, file 11, George McCrossan to William McQueen, 19 May 1930.

274 Notes
doi:10.15215/aupress/9781926836287.01
On the explosion of cheap restaurants in urban America in the interwar years, see Dorothy Sue Cobble, *Dishing It Out: Waitresses and Their Unions in the Twentieth Century*, 19–23.

James Struthers, *No Fault of Their Own: Unemployment and the Canadian Welfare State, 1914–1941*.

VCA, City Council Minutes, MCR 1-31, Meeting of the City Council, 31 December 1930.

“McInnis Opposes Logger Scheme,” *Vancouver Sun*, 4 November 1930.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Chairman, Finance Committee, 13 January 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-E-7, file 8, W.A. Sheppard to Relief Committee, 4 August 1932.

Chinese men who received meal tickets were segregated in practice, allotted tickets only for the Winnipeg Café. CC, series 20, box 15-E-7, file 8, W.A. Sheppard to Relief Committee, 4 August 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-1, file 15, Lee Kepment to Relief Committee, 31 January 1931.


CC, series 20, box 15-B-2, file 4, Mattias Nordin to Mayor and City Council, 29 May 1930.

CC, series 20, box 16-A-5, file 8, Report of Special Committee re Relief Tickets on Restaurants, 26 April 1933.


CC, series 20, box 16-A-6, file 6, Mayor Taylor to W.A. Sheppard, 29 November 1933.

CC, series 20, box 16-A-6, file 6, E.A. Gillingwater to Alderman Miller, 15 December 1932. See also K. Olsen to Alderman Dean, 8 December 1932.

CC, series 20, box 16-A-6, file 6, W.A. Sheppard to Mayor Taylor, 9 September 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-3, file 3, Mattias Nordin, Lyli Lindquist, and Ida Judd to City Council, 7 July 1932; CC, series 33, Committee Minutes, box 26-D, vol. 61, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 8 August 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-C-6, file 4, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 8 September 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-4, file 8, C. Robinson to City Clerk, 2 November 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-B-1, file 4, Harry Kydd to Alderman Miller, 15 May 1930.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-5, file 5, Mrs. Anne Bourque to Alderman H.J. DeGraves, n.d. [1931].


CC, series 20, box 15-B-1, file 8, John L. Lewis to Mayor Malkin, 20 May 1930.

CC, series 20, box 15-B-1, file 8, Ian Shaw to City Clerk, 23 January 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-B-1, file 8, Report of Special Committee re Relief Restaurants, 25 February 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-5, file 2, Report of Special Committee re Relief Restaurants, 22 April 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Chairman, Finance Committee, 13 January 1932.

CC, series 33, Committee Minutes, box 26-D, vol. 61, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 23 June 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-3, file 4, B. Nichol to W.A. Sheppard, 7 June 1932.

Notes 275

doi:10.15215/aupress/9781926836287.01
CC, series 20, box 15-F-3, file 4, F.F. Kennedy to W.A. Sheppard, 8 June 1932.

Unemployed Worker, n.d. [January 1931].

UBCSC, Angus MacInnis Memorial Collection, box 42A, file 26, Report of Delegation of Unemployed Sponsored by the British Columbia Joint Committee on Unemployment, Who Presented the Demands on Behalf of the Unemployed of British Columbia, Before the British Columbia Cabinet, 7 December 1934 at 10:30 a.m., 6.

CC, series 20, box 15-C-5, file 1, G. Connelly to Mayor Taylor, n.d. [1931].

CC, series 20, box 15-D-2, file 6, R. McNally to City Council, 24 April 1931.


CC, series 20, box 16-A-7, file 3, Fred Grange to Finance Committee, 6 December 1933.

Unemployed Worker, 21 March 1931.


UBCSC, Hotel, Restaurant and Culinary Employees and Bartenders Union, Local 28 Papers, box 5, Minutes of HRE, Local 28, 13 October 1933, 2 March 1936, 20 July 1936, 3 August 1936, 21 September 1936. My understanding of labour relations in restaurants has been greatly influenced by Cobble, Dishing It Out.

John Ahern, “Meal Ticket Charges,” Vancouver Sun, 17 December 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-B-2, file 11, Petition Presented to Alderman Atherton, 4 November 1930. For a discussion of this type of lodging, see Jill Wade, “Home or Homelessness? Marginal Housing in Vancouver, 1886–1950.”


CC, series 20, box 15-D-6, file 10, Letter of the Vancouver Direct Relief Association, n.d. [December 1931].

CC, series 33, Committee Minutes, box 26-D, vol. 61, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 14 December 1931; CC, series 20, box 15-C-4, file 5, J.J. Pennycooly to Mayor and City Council, 19 December 1931.

CC, series 33, Committee Minutes, box 26-D, vol. 60, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 25 January 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Finance Committee, 13 January 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-4, file 2, W.A. Sheppard to Mayor and City Council, 23 December 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-2, file 2, Report of Special Committee re Relief Tickets on Restaurants, 9 September 1932.

CC, series 20, box 16-A-6, file 6, W.A. Sheppard to Mayor Taylor, 9 September 1932; CC, series 33, Committee Minutes, box 26-D, vol. 61, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 7 November 1932.

Report of Special Committee re Relief Tickets on Restaurants, 9 September 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-2, file 2, Report of Special Committee re Relief Tickets on Restaurants, 22 September 1932.


CC, series 20, box 16-A-1, file 2, Frank Stead to W.A. Sheppard, 28 October 1933.


MO, series 483, box 33-B-2, file 3, W.R. Bone to Mayor Taylor, 26 October 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Finance Committee, 13 January 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-B-4, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Alderman W.C. Atherton, 24 November 1930.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-7, file 1, Donald Campbell to Finance Committee, 23 March 1933.

VSS, series 450, box 106-B-2, file 5, Memorandum of Relief Officer, 15 April 1931.

Notes

doi:10.15215/aupress/9781926836287.01
CC, series 33, Committee Minutes, box 26-D, vol. 61, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 19 October 1931.

CC, series 33, Committee Minutes, box 26-D, vol. 61, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 9 November 1931.

CC, series 33, Committee Minutes, box 26-D, vol. 61, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 19 December 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-E-4, file 9, Austin Levca to Relief Committee, 16 September 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-E-7, file 9, Geo. Poke to Mayor Taylor, 1 November 1932 (spelling as in original).

CC, series 20, box 15-E-6, file 5, E. Odlum to City Council, 26 October 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-7, file 8, City Clerk to Relief and Employment Committee, 2 November 1932.

VCA, City Council Minutes, MCR 1-33, Meeting of the City Council, 14 November 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-4, file 5, John Rivers to Mayor, 17 December 1931.


CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Finance Committee, 13 January 1932.


“Civic Relief Heads Scored,” Vancouver Sun, 11 December 1931.


CC, series 20, box 16-A-1, file 9, H.B. Hungerford to Relief Committee, 4 April 1933.

CC, series 20, box 16-A-1, file 9, H.B. Hungerford to City Council, 6 March 1933.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Chairman, Finance Committee, 13 January 1932.

Ibid.

Ibid.: VCA, City Council Minutes, MCR 1-31, Meeting of the City Council, 21 January 1931.

Meeting of the City Council, 21 January 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 8, Report of Special Committee on the Central City Mission, 29 March 1932.

CC, series 20, box 16-A-1, file 14, E.L. Slevin to Dr. J.W. McIntosh, 13 October 1933.


CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 2, Motions of the Working Class Ex-Servicemen’s League, 28 April 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-3, file 8, John Baird to City Council, 7 May 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 2 April 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 16 January 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 15 November 1930.

Unemployed Worker, n.d. [January 1931].

Ibid.

Background information on Charles and W.C. Woodward can be found in VCA, Add. Mss. 222, Woodward Family Papers, box 566-D-2.

“Private Citizens Offer to Care for 400 Jobless,” Vancouver Sun, 11 November 1930.

SFT, box 3, file 19, Henry B. Thomson to Premier S.F. Tolmie, 29 June 1931; CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Finance Committee, 13 January 1932.
Henry B. Thomson to Premier S.F. Tolmie, 29 June 1931 (emphasis in original).


CC, series 20, box 15-B-5, file 2, Unnamed to George Ireland, 16 April 1930.


CC, series 20, box 15-B-4, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 14 November 1930.

CC, series 20, box 15-C-7, file 6, A. Leslie Coote to Mr. Simmers, 15 March 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-C-4, file 4, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 21 September 1931.

CC, series 33, Committee Minutes, box 26-D, vol. 61, Meeting of the Relief and Employment Committee, 8 September 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-E-4, file 1, G.F. Gibson to Alderman Bennett, 19 July 1932.


CC, series 20, box 15-C-4, file 4, Minutes of the Relief and Employment Committee, 21 September 1931; CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Finance Committee, 13 January 1932.


Unemployed Worker, 17 October 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Alderman A.G. Harvey, 8 January 1932.


Tutte denied even meeting with Richardson. MO, series 483, box 33-B-2, file 1, F.H. Richardson to Mayor Taylor; Statement of A.E. Tutte, 3 September 1932; W.R. Bone to Mayor Taylor, 6 September 1932.

BCA, GR 2586, Provincial Health Officer, Records Regarding Disease Outbreaks, box 3, file 6, Ada Muir and John Baird to H.E. Young, 14 February 1932; H.E. Young to Ada Muir, 19 February 1932; Ada Muir to H.E. Young, 21 February 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 24 October 1931.

Ada Muir to H.E. Young, 21 February 1932.

Veteran, “Legion Opens Soup Kitchen in Spite of Relief Promised,” Vancouver Sun, 8 November 1930.

CC, series 20, box 15-E-7, file 12, C. Robinson to City Clerk, 21 June 1932; Mary Miller to City Council, 31 October 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 12 September 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 21 November 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-6, file 10, Demands of Vancouver Unemployed Workers Organization, n.d. [1931].

H.W. Cooper to Finance Committee, 13 January 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 28 March 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 26 December 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 28 March 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 14 November 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 2 April 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 16 April 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 7 January 1933.

MO, series 483, box 33-B-2, file 1, Secretary to the Mayor to W.R. Bone, 19 July 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 14 November 1931.

During this period, relief recipients who were overpaid by the Relief Department saw future allotments cut until the amount was repaid. VSS, series 449, box 106-A-5, file 10, R.J. Lecky to W.R. Bone, 29 October 1932.

278 Notes
doi:10.15215/aupress/9781926836287.01
Report of F. Jellett to W. R. Bone, 1 August 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 6 February 1932.

George Watson to C. N. James, 5 February 1932.


Report of Special Committee on the Central City Mission, 18 May 1931.

Bylaws of the Vancouver Welfare Federation, n.d.

VCA, Pamphlet 1931-11, Vancouver Welfare Federation, If You Were Face to Face (Vancouver, 1931).

Ibid.


VCA, series 20, box 15-B-1, file 1, Hamilton Read to City Clerk, 3 November 1930.

VCA, Pamphlet 1931-2, Vancouver Welfare Federation, Sure! I’ll Share (Vancouver, 1931).

Ibid.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 8, Report of Special Committee on the Central City Mission, 29 March 1932.

Meeting of CCM Board of Directors, 27 November 1930.

Meeting of CCM Board of Directors, 11 December 1930.

Meeting of CCM Board of Directors, 2 June 1931.

Meeting of CCM Board of Directors, 1 December 1931.

George Watson to C. N. James, 5 February 1932.


Report re “Reference Slip” System of Preventing Panhandling, as Arranged Between Federation and the Central City Mission, 12 May 1932.


J. H. T. Falk, Some Samples of Cases of Men Using the Ticket System to an Extent Which Indicates the Need for Action on the Part of the Social Worker at the Mission, n.d. [April 1932].

Minutes of CCM Executive Committee Meeting, 14 April 1932.


Meeting of CCM Board of Directors, 10 May, 5 December 1932.

Y. H. Stevenson, “City Mission Lays Cards on Table in Challenge to Mud-Slingers,” 10 January 1934. 2. This purported to be the product of an investigation by the Trans-Canada News Service.

Central City Mission, Financial Statement for Month of April 1932.

Report of Special Committee on the Central City Mission, 29 March 1932.

George Watson to Alderman Fraser, 23 March 1932.

Notes 279
Chapter 5: “Work Without Wages,” or Paving the Way for Economic Development

2. SFT, box 8, file 21, Charles McHardy to S.F. Tolmie, 31 October 1931.
3. SFT, box 8, file 22, Pat Philip to S.F. Tolmie, 12 January 1933.
4. Ibid.
5. The best statement on the centrality of property rights in the early development of British Columbia is Tina Loo, *Making Law, Order, and Authority in British Columbia, 1821–1871*.
10. Foucault also argued that relations of signification were distinct from those of discipline:

    It soon appeared to me that, while the human subject is placed in relations of production and of signification, he is equally placed in power relations that are very complex. Now, it seemed to me that economic history and theory provided a good instrument for relations of production, and that linguistics and semiotics offered instruments for studying relations of signification — but for power relations we had no tools of study. “The Subject and Power,” in *Michel Foucault: Power*, 327.
Ibid., 69. It should be noted that Foucault came to reject the experiential framework employed in this book and would no doubt have reworked the notion of an “ethical consciousness” to discard its humanist elements. See “Preface to The History of Sexuality, Volume 2,” in The Foucault Reader, 333–39.

Foucault, History of Madness, 73.

Foucault, Discipline and Punish, 25–26. See also the argument concerning panopticism in Discipline and Punish, 220–21.

Ibid., 175.

In this category, we can include Kay J. Anderson, Vancouver’s Chinatown: Racial Discourse in Canada, 1875–1980; Cole Harris, Making Native Space: Colonialism, Resistance, and Reserves in British Columbia; and Loo, Making Law, Order, and Authority.

For relevant Canadian works on attempts to reform the subjectivity of the poor, see, among others, James Pitsula, “The Treatment of Tramps in Late Nineteenth-Century Toronto,” and Mary Anne Poutanen, “The Homeless, the Whore, the Drunkard and the Disorderly: Contours of Female Vagrancy in the Montreal Courts, 1810–1842.”


Peter Campbell, Canadian Marxists and the Search for a Third Way; Mark Leier, Where the Fraser River Flows: The Industrial Workers of the World in British Columbia; Ross McCormack, Reformers, Rebels, and Revolutionaries: The Western Canadian Radical Movement 1899–1919.

Paul Craven, “An Impartial Umpire”: Industrial Relations and the Canadian State 1900–1911.

The most important letters in this exchange are found in the National Archives of Canada, RG 27, Department of Labour, Strikes and Lockouts files, vol. 350, Strike 17, H.H. Ward to F.E. Harrison, 19 February 1932; M. O’Dougherty to Bolton, 26 February 1932. See also vol. 351, Strike 47, H.H. Ward to P. Philip, 13 May 1932. The federal department continued to clip news articles on relief camp strikes, especially from the Unemployed Worker. The standard official paperwork produced by employers and employees, however, was rarely involved.

James Struthers, for example, does not see the regime of work camps as another form of capitalist production, instead labelling them a “government-sponsored perversion of capitalist values.” No Fault of Their Own: Unemployment and the Canadian Welfare State, 1914–1941. 98–99, 134.

Patrick Brennan, “‘Thousands of Our Men Are Getting Practically Nothing at All to Do’: Public Works Relief Programs in Regina and Saskatoon, 1929–1940”; Bill Waiser, Park Prisoners: The Untold Story of Western Canada’s National Parks, 1915–1946. Unemployed Worker, 15 November 1930.

Unemployed Worker, 10 June 1932.

PW, box 3-B-2, file 4, Minutes of the Public Works Committee, 20 October 1930.

PW, box 3-B-2, file 4, Minutes of the Public Works Committee, 23 October 1930.

Ibid.

PW, box 3-B-2, file 4, Minutes of the Public Works Committee, 30 October 1930, 11 November 1930.

PW, box 3-B-2, file 4, Minutes of the Public Works Committee, 11 November, 1 December 1930.

PW, box 3-B-2, file 4, Minutes of the Public Works Committee, 1 December 1930.

PW, box 3-B-2, file 4, Minutes of the Public Works Committee, 27 November, 1 and 15 December 1930.

PW, box 3-B-2, file 1, Minutes of the Public Works Committee, 12 and 19 January 1931.

PW, box 3-B-2, file 1, Minutes of the Public Works Committee, 26 January, 2 February, 23 March 1931.
I thank James Wishart for introducing me to this phrase. See his “Class Difference and the Reformation of Ontario Public Hospitals, 1900–1935: ‘Make Every Effort to Satisfy the Tastes of the Well-to-Do.’”

The term concentration camp was one of the popular designations for work relief camps in 1930s North America, indicating the generalized understanding of the centrality of confinement in order for such programs to function effectively.

I thank James Wishart for introducing me to this phrase. See his “Class Difference and the Reformation of Ontario Public Hospitals, 1900–1935: ‘Make Every Effort to Satisfy the Tastes of the Well-to-Do.’”

The term concentration camp was one of the popular designations for work relief camps in 1930s North America, indicating the generalized understanding of the centrality of confinement in order for such programs to function effectively.

“McInnis Opposes Logger Scheme,” Vancouver Sun, 4 November 1930.

“City Seeks Camp for Idle Men,” Vancouver Sun, 12 November 1930.

Not a “Bum,” “Men Seeking Relief Not ‘Bums,’” Vancouver Sun, 6 November 1930.

“Back to the Woods,” Unemployed Worker, 8 November 1930.

The term concentration camp was one of the popular designations for work relief camps in 1930s North America, indicating the generalized understanding of the centrality of confinement in order for such programs to function effectively.

“McInnis Opposes Logger Scheme,” Vancouver Sun, 4 November 1930.

“City Seeks Camp for Idle Men,” Vancouver Sun, 12 November 1930.

Not a “Bum,” “Men Seeking Relief Not ‘Bums,’” Vancouver Sun, 6 November 1930.

“Back to the Woods,” Unemployed Worker, 8 November 1930.

The term concentration camp was one of the popular designations for work relief camps in 1930s North America, indicating the generalized understanding of the centrality of confinement in order for such programs to function effectively.
Kamloops Sentinel, 26 and 30 June 1931.

SFT, box 12, file 23, G.A.B. MacDonald to P. Philip, 12 June 1931.

SFT, box 12, file 23, J.P. Morgan to P. Philip, n.d. [summer 1931].

CC, series 20, box 15-D-6, file 10, Union of BC Municipalities, Resolutions to Be Placed Before the Government, n.d. [September 1931].

CC, series 20, box 15-E-4, file 1, J. Islay Mutter to Mayor Taylor, 15 March 1932.

SFT, box 1, file 3, S.F. Tolmie to L.R. Andrews, 8 January 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 4 April 1931.

On the broader context for municipal campaigns, see John Taylor, “Relief from Relief: The Cities’ Answer to Depression Dependency.”

SFT, box 9, file 8, S.F. Tolmie to R.B. Bennett, 14 January 1931.

SFT, box 7, file 3, S.F. Tolmie to J.W. Jones, 13 February 1931.

SFT, box 3, file 20, Clipping from Salmon Arm Observer, 25 June 1931.

SFT, box 8, file 21, Report of the Chief Engineer, Department of Public Works, on the Unemployment Situation, 5 August 1930.

SFT, box 8, file 19, R.W. Bruhn to S.F. Tolmie, 22 April 1931; R.W. Bruhn to S.F. Tolmie, 30 April 1931.

See report in Horn, ed.; Struthers.

SFT, box 12, file 20, S.F. Tolmie to Gideon Robertson, 19 June 1931.

Struthers, No Fault of Their Own, 52–54.


SFT, box 34, file 12, P. Philip, Short Outline of Administration of Unemployment Relief in British Columbia, 6 January 1933.

Ibid.

Struthers, No Fault of Their Own, 57.

JWJ, vol. 1, file 3, R.B. Bennett to J.W. Jones, 16 October 1931.

SFT, box 8, file 21, S.F. Tolmie to P. Philip, 19 October 1931.

SFT, box 7, file 3, Deputy Minister of Finance to Premier Tolmie, 22 October 1931.

SFT, R.H. Pooley to J.W. Jones, 28 October 1931.

SFT, J.W. Jones to S.F. Tolmie, 3 November 1931.


SFT, J.W. Jones to S.F. Tolmie, 30 October 1931.

SFT, box 7, file 5, E.D. Johnson to Acting Minister of Finance, 31 October 1931.

SFT, box 12, file 20, P. Philip to all District Engineers, 31 October 1931; SFT, box 9, file 16, S.F. Tolmie, Circular Letter, 2 February 1932. This letter, which outlined the Tolmie cabinet’s rationale for its work camp program, was sent to influential Tories in Ottawa: Brigadier General A.D. McRae, Senator; H.H. Stevens, MP and Minister of Trade and Commerce; John Fraser, MP; W. Esling, MP; H. Barbour, MP; D. B. Plunkett, MP; Gorte Sterling, MP; George Black, MP and Speaker; and George H. Barnard, KC and Senator.

SFT, box 8, file 19, P. Walker, Memorandum for Premier Tolmie, 3 November 1931.

SFT, box 8, file 21, P. Philip to S.F. Tolmie, 16 November 1931.

SFT, box 12, file 20, S.F. Tolmie to R.B. Bennett, 21 December 1931.

SFT, box 12, file 20, J.W. Jones to E.B. Ryckman, 5 November 1931.

SFT, box 8, file 19, Resolution of the Central Conservative Association of Salmon Arm, n.d.

106 SFT, box 12, file 25, P. Philip to S.F. Tolmie, 27 October 1931.
108 SFT, box 8, file 19, S.G. Blaylock to S.F. Tolmie, 26 October 1931.
109 SFT, box 8, file 19, R.W. Bruhn to S.F. Tolmie, 28 October 1931.
110 UBCSC, Nelson Seymour Lougheed Papers, box 1, file 1, N.S. Lougheed, Memorandum for the Premier, 5 May 1932.
111 SFT, box 7, file 11, Analysis Made of Kidd Report, 3 September 1932.
112 SFT, box 9, file 19, S.F. Tolmie to George Black, 31 October 1931.
113 SFT, box 21, file 2, J.W. Jones to A.H. Williamson, 23 December 1932.
116 SFT, box 21, file 2, Report of Select Committee of the Legislative Assembly on Unemployment, 11 April 1932, 4, 6.
118 See, for example, the complaints of Percy Broadfoot, a Conservative Party functionary, to leading federal Tories like H.H. Stevens and Leon Ladner. VCA, Add. Mss. 641, Leon J. Ladner Papers, vol. 7, file 45, Percy Broadfoot to General A.D. McRae and others, 30 May 1929.
119 The best account of patronage and the Tories is Parker, “Simon Fraser Tolmie.”
121 SFT, box 6, file 9, R.H. Pooley to S.F. Tolmie, 25 August 1930.
122 See the exchange between Tolmie and the Saanich Conservative Association in SFT, box 3, file 19: A.H. Spurr to S.F. Tolmie, 31 August 1931; S.F. Tolmie to A.H. Spurr, 5 September 1931; A.H. Spurr to S.F. Tolmie, 10 September 1931; S.F. Tolmie to A.H. Spurr, 9 October 1931.
123 SFT, box 1, file 18, Minutes of the Executive Committee of the BC Conservative Association, 13 February 1932.
124 SFT, box 8, file 21, John McBride to S.F. Tolmie, 28 October 1931.
125 SFT, box 1, file 18, C.E. Barry to Lindley Crease, 12 March 1932.
126 SFT, box 1, file 12, A. MacArthur to S.F. Tolmie, 1 November 1932.
129 Ibid.
131 SFT, box 8, file 19, Dr. C.M. Kingston to S.F. Tolmie, 19 September 1931.
132 TDP, vol. 34, file 1, L.L. Adams to T.D. Pattullo, 8 December 1931.
133 SFT, box 7, file 9, Ed Bush to S.F. Tolmie, 6 April 1932.
134 Report of Select Committee, 6.
135 Report of Select Committee, 13–15. There is no record that the hearings were broadcast on the radio; Brown may have referred to news reports about the committee hearings.
136 Ibid.
137 SFT, box 6, file 12, R.H. Pooley to S.F. Tolmie, 18 October 1930; SFT, box 2, file 23, Ku Klux Klan to S.F. Tolmie, 29 September 1932, and W.H. Morrison to S.F. Tolmie, 7 August 1933; and the numerous letters from Morrison in box 5, files 12 and 13.
138 SFT, box 21, file 7, Extract from Victoria Times-Colonist, 13 November 1931.
139 See, for example, SFT, box 21, file 25, Extract from Vancouver Province, 18 December 1931.
Imagine the following hypothetical scenario. Suppose the average common labourer on a road-building project earns $4.00 per day, the standard for this class of work in the fall of 1931, to shovel a hundred mounds of dirt. They are free to spend this wage as they like at the end of the day. Assuming a one-to-one relationship between wages earned and dirt shovelled, the labourer would receive $2.40 for a day for which their efficiency rate was 60 percent. In the relief camps, married men received $2.80 and single men $2.00. However, the government received not only labour but also 85 cents per day in automatic deductions. The cost to the Tolmie government to house transients was 87.1 cents (60.5 for food and 26.6 for overhead costs), meaning a loss of 2.1 cents per man per day. In other words, camp inmates paid for their own food and shelter. In reality, married men cleared $1.95 and single men $1.20 on the days they worked. On idle days, they would lose money. To this must be added high prices at government stores. Selling for above-market prices, goods like blankets, rain slickers, boots, and tobacco returned a share of the relief wage to the state. Thus, it is not clear that the economic policies of Philip’s camp system were less efficient or fiscally sound than the traditional workings of industries like construction, logging, and mining.


On federal deportation policies in this period, see Barbara Roberts, Whence They Came: Deportation from Canada, 1900–1935.

P. G. Griffin et al. to Inspector Thomson.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-4, file 9, H. W. Cooper to Alderman Atherton, 28 September 1931.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-4, file 9, Unemployed Delegation to Colonel Cooper, 28 September 1931.

Ibid.

VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 11, “Demonstrate at City Hall” handbill, n.d. [September 1931].

Unemployed Delegation to Colonel Cooper, 28 September 1931.

Ibid. Workers were to be paid for time lost due to inclement weather, since the province intended to deduct board charges daily, whether or not work was done. The delegation also called for meal tickets to be redeemable at any restaurant and for the release of all “class war prisoners.”

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H. T. Whitehead to H. W. Cooper, 12 January 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-4, file 9, H. W. Cooper to J. Brodsky, 28 September 1931.

VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 13, Acting Chief Constable to Chief Constable D. C. Draper, 5 October 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 3 October 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 10 October 1931.


Unemployed Worker, 17 October 1931.

Ibid.

UBCSC, Nelson Seymour Lougheed Papers, box 1, file 5, Equipment Inventory, Abernethy Lougheed Logging Company Ltd., 31 October 1931.

TDP, vol. 43, file 4, P. Philip to J.B. Sutherland, 17 September 1931; SFT, box 12, file 24, Report on Allco Camps Presented to Hon. R.H. Pooley, Acting Minister of Finance, 9 November 1931; Equipment Inventory, Abernethy Lougheed Logging Company Ltd.


S.F. Tolmie, Circular Letter, 2 February 1932.

SFT, box 12, file 20, S.F. Tolmie to H.H. Stevens, 20 June 1931.

SFT, box 12, file 20, S.F. Tolmie to R.B. Bennett, 20 June 1931.


Ibid. See also Speech of Premier S.F. Tolmie, Annual Meeting of the BC Conservative Association, 24.


SFT, box 12, file 20, S.F. Tolmie to Leon Ladner, 12 December 1931.

“They did not now consider a man who went out to the camps as a scab, but if they had to go, go down to 49 Powell E & get their credentials so as to carry on the organizing amongst their camps.” VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, file 14, Report of H.G. Smith to Deputy Chief Hood, 30 October 1931. The police were detailed to attend meetings of the National Unemployed Workers’ Association, the Canadian Labor Defence League and the Working-Class Ex-Servicemen’s League. Their reports are collected in VPD, series 199, box 75-F-1, files 13 and 14.

Unemployed Worker, 21 November 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 10 October 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 6 February 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-D-6, file 9, R.E. Timmins to City Clerk, 26 June 1931.


CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Alderman A.G. Harvey, 18 January 1932.

CC, series 20, box 15-F-1, file 1, H.W. Cooper to Alderman A.G. Harvey, 21 March 1932.

SFT, box 8, file 19, R.W. Bruhn to S.F. Tolmie, 28 October 1931.

SFT, box 3, file 9, W.S. Simpson to S.F. Tolmie, 20 July 1933.

Report of Select Committee, 6.

Unemployed Worker, 31 October 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 5 December 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 14 November 1931.


Unemployed Worker, 19 December 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 20 February 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 7 January 1933.

Unemployed Worker, 16 January, 6 February 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 26 December 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 27 February 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 16 January 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 2 and 30 January 1932.

Montreal Star, 15 February 1932.


CC, series 20, box 15-E-3, file 1, Wilberforce Cooper to City Council, 24 February 1932.

Ibid.

Unemployed Worker, 12 September 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 24 October 1931.

Unemployed Worker, 21 November 1931.

“Higher Mathematics for the Unemployed.” Unemployed Worker, 5 March 1932.

“Higher Mathematics.”

CC, series 20, box 16-A-6, file 6, E. A. Gillingwater to Alderman Miller, 15 December 1932.

“Higher Mathematics.”

Ibid.

Ibid.

VCA, City Council Minutes, MCR 1-32, Meeting of the City Council, 23 February 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 5 March 1932.

Arthur Evans to City Council, 4 March 1932. Evans’s claim was not altogether unfounded. The City of Vancouver had organized a celebratory dinner to commemorate the arrival of one of the Siamese Royal Family in the summer of 1931.

BPC, series 180, box 75-A-2, file 2, Meeting of the Board of Police Commissioners, 5 March 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 5 March 1932.

The Worker, 16 April 1932.

Unemployed Worker, 2 and 9 April 1932.


Vancouver Province, 6 May 1932.

Vancouver Sun, 5 May 1932. This would be the Scottsboro Boys.

Vancouver Province, 7 May 1932.

Stanley Hutcheson, *Depression Stories*, 78–79.

Conclusion: Vancouver, “The Mecca of the Surplus”

1 “Fitter Happier” is from the 1997 album OK Computer (EMI). Lyrics can be found at http://www.greenplastic.com/radiohead-lyrics/ok-computer/fitter-happier/. It says something about the power of Fordist ideas that the computerized voice used in “Fitter Happier” was described by Thom Yorke, lead singer of Radiohead, as “the most emotional voice I have ever heard.”


3 This is the root premise of many classic studies of relief provision for the poor. See, for example, Richard B. Splane, Social Welfare in Ontario, 1791–1893: A Study of Public Welfare Administration.


6 The Relief Department bears some responsibility for the armies of homeless men who descended upon Vancouver, since many of their policies were designed first and foremost to turn poor men into transients for administrative and financial purposes.

7 Kamloops Sentinel, 3 January 1930.

8 David Rees, Get Your War On. The cartoon quoted was posted on 7 August 2002 at http://www.mnftiu.cc but has since been removed from the site.

9 CC, series 20, box 15-E-4, file 11, City Council Motion Sheet, Aldermen Deptford and Dean, 15 August 1932.

10 CC, series 20, box 16-A-3, file 1, City Council Motion Sheet, Aldermen Smith and Deptford, 8 March 1933.

11 James Overton, “Public Relief and Social Unrest in Newfoundland in the 1930s: An Evaluation of the Ideas of Piven and Cloward.”

doi:10.15215/aupress/9781926836287.01